

# Global Citizenship Education Curriculum Development & Integration

Situational Analyses  
under the 2<sup>nd</sup> Round Project

**LEBANON**



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization

**APCEIU**

Asia-Pacific Centre of  
Education for International Understanding  
under the auspices of UNESCO



RÉPUBLIQUE LIBANAISE  
**CRDP**  
Centre de Recherche  
et de Développement  
Pédagogiques

**Global Citizenship Education  
Curriculum Development & Integration**  
Situational Analyses under the 2nd Round Project

# **LEBANON**

**Publisher**



© APCEIU & CRDP 2019

All rights reserved.

**Disclaimer**

The ideas and opinions expressed in this report are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent the views of the APCEIU. The author is responsible for the choice and presentation of facts contained in this publication. The maps, pictures, and symbols presented do not imply any opinion on the part of APCEIU.

# Global Citizenship Education Curriculum Development & Integration

Situational Analyses  
under the 2<sup>nd</sup> Round Project

## LEBANON



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization

APCEIU

Asia-Pacific Centre  
of  
Education for International Understanding  
under the auspices of UNESCO

RÉPUBLIQUE LIBANAISE  
CRDP  
Centre de Recherche  
et de Développement  
Pédagogiques

# Contents

Preface .....	5		
Introduction .....	7	2. The Second Set: Educational Equipment .....	33
Purpose of the Study and Research Methodology .....	9	3. The Third Set: Strategies and Curriculum Development Workshops .....	33
Results of the Study .....	10	- The Cognitive Domain .....	34
A. Adopted Textbooks, The Plan for Upgrading the Educational System and The Official General Education Curricula 1997 .....	10	- The Social Emotional Domain .....	35
B. Supportive Programs and Supplementary Curricula, and a Plan to Develop Educational Curricula in Conformity with the Terminology of Global Citizenship according to the Curriculum Adopted by UNESCO (2015) .....	24	- Behavioral Domain .....	36
Results of the Terminology Survey .....	25	Suggestions and Recommendations .....	37
First Conclusion: .....	28		
1. The First Set: Curricula and Supplementary Programs .....	29		
- The Cognitive Domain .....	29		
- Socio-Emotional Domain .....	30		
- Behavioral Domain .....	31		



## Preface

Education is the first defense of the country of Lebanon.

Education enables our children to develop a unified culture that brings us together, and an educational immunity that strengthens our unity. Therefore, our children live in safety, happiness and independence, and get the responsible freedom and active citizenship to deserve this immortal homeland.

The Center for Educational Research and Development is committed to building a human being and a citizen. The Educational Development Plan (1994) revolves around several national concepts, the most important thereof are: faith, freedom and democracy, justice, equality and peace, solidarity, cooperation and interaction, ethics, values and human principles, loyalty to the homeland and identity, culture and belonging, coexistence and openness to the world and others.

Today, we are on the verge of new curricula. The first and foremost purpose of these curricula is to prepare citizens committed to their Lebanese identity first, aware of their national duties and defending their right to live together on the land of the country, seeking hand in hand to build a state of justice and renew the social and political contract, on a firm basis that preserves human dignity and respects diversity and constructive communication, promotes citizenship and living together. The Human being is a value in themselves, they are the mind and conscience, dignity, freedom and truth! It is precisely on the basis of this conviction that the Center for Educational Research and Development addressed the project of Global Citizenship Education.

Introducing the concept of Global Citizenship into our society, our schools and the minds of our children has become an inevitable reality, especially with the promulgation of laws that foster the

equivalences of foreign certificates in the country. This makes it imperative for us to deepen the study of this concept and its dimensions and to be mindful of the sensibilities that could result, and of the congruence, and similarity and incompatibility between the concept of Lebanese Citizenship and Global Citizenship, based on the Lebanese Constitution, laws and regulations that govern and regulate the Education.

In order to understand the UNESCO-supported Global Citizenship Education Project in which concepts revolved around an educated, informed, critical, respectful, and ethically responsible learner; the Joint Academic Departments at the Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD) and a group of educational researchers conducted two studies. The first study addressed the availability of Global Citizenship concepts in the general education curricula (all educational subjects in all cycles and grades), while the second study examined the availability of Global Citizenship concepts in the supplementary curricula and programs and projects that support the Lebanese curriculum. The result was about 200 formats that were synthesized to present you its findings today.

In this sense, the integration of any concept in the Lebanese curriculum under the umbrella of Global Citizenship or others, must take into account the nature of our society and our vision of the world, and must approach our educational system to any idea that may have a negative impact or contradicts with the Lebanese law and system.

Accordingly, the Center for Educational Research and Development aspires to develop the Lebanese curricula towards interactive curricula that meet these requirements by defining the features of tomorrow's learner, the citizen of the age of communication, openness and globalization.

Last but not least, because "In Education We Protect Our Homeland", we are engaged in the workshop of building the national future; driven by a firm and unwavering commitment to national values.

Long Live open education to the world, Long Live Lebanon.

**Dr. Nada Oweijane**

President of Center for Educational Research and Development per Interim

## Introduction

Lebanon has known formal education for a long time, before and after independence, and its schools have adopted different types of foreign curricula, because most of the private schools were established by European and American missions. The number of public schools increased during the French Mandate period (1919-1943), and these schools adopted French curricula with minor modifications. After Lebanon gained its independence in 1943, its government developed national curricula in 1946 that focused on building a responsible citizen who is working to improve their country. Therefore, most of the books developed during that period included elements of Lebanese citizenship. After the internal armed events in 1958, the voices calling for reform and change in the curriculum have been raised, especially in terms of the elements of citizenship, and that's what happened in the curricula of 1968-1971. The Lebanese educational system waited for a long time to review these curricula, especially after the civil war that began in 1975 and ended in 1989 due to the Taif Agreement.

As part of the reconstruction process, a plan for the development of education was established in 1994 by the Center for Educational Research and Development to be the basis on which curricula and other educational work were built upon. This plan included general objectives that can be considered valid for any reform initiative, including: "Promoting national belonging and integration, spiritual and cultural openness, and providing the new generation with the necessary knowledge, experience and skills, with an emphasis on the civic education and authentic Lebanese values such as freedom, democracy, tolerance and non-violence...and keeping up with the scientific progress and technological development and enhance interaction with global cultures" (p.4). The plan was based on human, national, and social dimensions.

It should be noted that although the focus of curricula was on local citizenship; the objectives included global citizenship elements, such as spiritual and cultural openness, freedom, democracy, tolerance and interaction with global cultures, in order to build a citizen "who is committed to values, morals and humanity" (Objective C), in line with what was mentioned about Lebanon in the national dimensions, p.7 "Lebanon is also a founding and active member of the United Nations and committed to its charters and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the country embodies these principles in all fields and domains without exception."

Following the development plan, the Center for Educational Research and Development established a new structure for education in Lebanon in 1995, which included the division of cycles as: Kindergarten, Primary Education, which consists of three cycles: the first cycle from grades 1-3; the second from grades 4-6; the third from grade 7-9, and it ends with the Intermediate Official Certificate "Brevet". The final Cycle is the three-year Secondary Education, which is divided into two cycles in the Second Secondary and four cycles in the Third Secondary (Literature and Humanities, Sociology and Economics, Life Science, and General science); it ends with the baccalaureate.

The 1997 educational curricula were based on the development plan; its general objectives are a translation and a confirmation to what was mentioned in the plan, such as: "Building the character of the individual, building a citizen and thus building a united, cohesive Lebanese society capable of performing its civilized role in the global community in general, and in its Arab community in particular". The curriculum aims at building a citizen who is proud of their homeland Lebanon and their belonging to it and committed to its issues; and proud of their Arab identity and belonging and committed to them; their spiritual heritage that emanates from the divine religions and adheres to human values and ethics; and understanding their national history away from a partisan society towards a united and humanly open society (Curricula, p. 4). The curriculum focused first on the upbringing of students as future (local) citizens with the knowledge and values that would qualify them to rebuild a society that was adversely affected by the civil war. It also carried many ideas aimed at building a human being who sees what is outside their homeland as an extension of human relations and dealing with others in a civilized way.

As for the structure of the Lebanese educational system, it is based on two sectors of education: governmental or official sector, managed by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education, and the private sector that the Ministry has the right to supervise. It is worth mentioning that the private sector has the majority of students (61.9%).

## **Purpose of the Study and Research Methodology:**

The main purpose of this study is to conduct a survey of the elements of global citizenship according to the curriculum adopted by UNESCO (2015), these elements are available in the Lebanese curriculum and to develop a methodological framework for cooperation with Asia-Pacific Centre of Education for International Understanding.

What the Lebanese team has done here is to look into the educational development plan that was developed as a breakthrough for educational reform after the Taif Conference (1989), and looking as well into the curricula, textbooks and supplementary curricula that were developed from 1997 to 2001.

To understand the reality of the elements of global citizenship in the Lebanese curriculum, we conducted two studies. The first study addressed the availability of Global Citizenship concepts in the general education curricula (all educational subjects in all cycles and grades), while the second study examined the availability of Global Citizenship concepts in the supplementary curricula and programs and projects that support the Lebanese curriculum.

To this end, a research team was formed from the personnel of the Center for Educational Research and Development and educational experts, who are multi-experienced, in order to study the components of the development plan, the curricula, and the content of the 17 subjects taught in all grades from kindergarten to the 12th grade or the end of secondary grade. The work was considered as a scientific research that adopted clear and interrelated steps. After the distribution of tasks, each participant talked about the subject of their choice, examined all its objectives, phrases, activities,

and texts, placing a sign on the criteria list, if an element of global citizenship was available. This list was provided by UNESCO and was entitled as follows: "Survey of Global Citizenship Terminology in the Educational Development Plan, Public Education Curricula 1997 Decree No. 10227/97, and Textbooks Adopted by UNESCO Curriculum, 2015", the result was about 200 formats that were synthesized to showcase their findings in the second section of the document. The first step was Data Collection. Then there was the categorization phase, where convergent criteria were selected for the appropriate information in the books of each subject. The unit of analysis was the word, phrase, or meaning of a sentence. Then the analysis of data started to reach specific conclusions. This is all shown in detail.

The plan to present the parts of this study is to bring together similar subjects: Art in all its forms, Science and Mathematics, Social Studies, and Languages. Separate subjects such as Informatics and Philosophy were also put into formats to reduce the number of documents in this study. What we will review is what we found in the sources of pre-university education in Lebanon, based on the tables that included the criteria adopted by UNESCO, and analyzed according to the domains developed by UNESCO: the cognitive domain, the socio-emotional domain and the behavioral domain, in which the terminology form included (194 terms), was divided into three forms according to the three domains (cognitive, socio-emotional, behavioral).

## **Results of the Study:**

This section includes the results of the academic survey on the availability of global citizenship concepts in the Lebanese curriculum as defined by UNESCO (2015).

### **A. Adopted Textbooks, The Plan for Upgrading the Educational System and The Official General Education Curricula 1997**

We analyzed the data collected in social studies for all cycles: Civics, History, Geography, Sociology and Economics, within the cognitive domain, while adopting one of the numbers (1) and (0): (1) the element is available; (0) the element is not available.

The analysis of the cognitive domain is essential in this work, because it allows for the identification of the elements contained in the texts of the books of each subject, and then gathering the subjects that make an academic field themselves.

In Civics, human rights are found in the subject, except for the "indigenous people" because Lebanon does not have an indigenous group that has been marginalized, like what happened to the Indians in America or the "Aborigines" in Australia. When knowledge is available, the teacher can move their students to advanced stages in terms of understanding the social status of the human being, and developing positive values towards them. This applies to building local and global citizenship. This knowledge was introduced to grades 8 and 9 where students became aware of the meaning of human rights. With regard to freedom of expression, this subject includes all elements of this chapter except freedom of criticism, perhaps because the terminology is not used very frequently. As for social justice, the subject has all its components, and in classes where students are 15 years of age or older. Concerning gender equality, it is available; this topic is freely covered. The elements of democracy are also available in the books of this subject, especially as it provides the learner with political and legal culture. This in turn entailed making sure that there was human rights education because the texts of the lessons included that. The same also applies to peace education, especially since Lebanon has lacked peace in several periods of its current history, so providing learners with the meaning and principles of peace has become important for students and society as a whole. It should be noted that peace education does not mean giving up, and does not contradict the commitment of the citizen and the duty to defend their country against the aggressors and uphold the right to do so.

As for the awareness about the types and causes of conflict, the textbooks of Civics included enough information to be at the disposal of the teacher and students to acquire and use them appropriately. There is a distinction between physical and moral violence. Domestic violence and child labor have been covered as well. Globalization has a fair share in the lessons because all societies live in the era of globalization. The learner must know from an early age the meaning of this concept and how to benefit from its positive aspects while being aware of its risks to negatively affect the privacy of the Lebanese identity and heritage. The concept of good governance has been mentioned as a model of what governance should be to take care of the citizens. The books of this subject also dealt

with the concept of "North and South" to refer to the economic differences between the two parts of the universe; where the North is rich and developed, and the South is poor and developing. This, like other topics, arouses the interest of the learner in what is happening in the world as a whole. The books also contain information about wars and conflicts where the images of destruction, displacement and all that is negative are highlighted. The global citizen renounces this and strives to avoid or prevent it. The "migrants and refugees" chapter thus complements the negative perception of human-induced conflicts, some of which have been addressed in the lessons of the subject.

Environment was covered in this subject also where sustainable environment, ecosystems, biodiversity and desertification are dealt with in terms of the damage of these subjects from a scientific perspective to analyze what is happening in nature. Natural disasters are also covered here. The content of the books contains information on sustainable development, water quality, and the Millennium Goals almost individually. As for the Sociology, it included most elements of human rights, and this is expected because it revolves around human life, behaviors and institutions. Therefore, its content in the three secondary grades is to address a number of human concerns. The chapter of freedom of expression includes most of the freedoms that the human being has, and the Lebanese citizen in particular; because the content must copy the Constitution and the laws in force in the country. The same applies to the chapter of social justice that the subject addresses all its elements. As for equality, the lessons of the subject included two out of three elements, and the chapter of democracy included all its elements except democratic institutions. This should not have happened because institution-building is one of the human social activity aspects. Human rights education had all the elements, while peace education contained one element; the "culture of peace." Most elements of the chapter of awareness about the types of conflict are found in the lessons of this subject. The same applies for the chapters of: globalization, the North and the South, while the chapter of migration was covered slightly. The rest of the themes included few of the elements of sociology such as war, extremism, epidemics and sustainable development. As for History, its content is devoid of most of the cognitive elements that are associated with human rights, freedoms, democracy and social justice. The subject clearly includes war and conflict, arms race, nuclear armament race and the refugees. It is deemed to be insufficient for a subject that talks about what happened in the country and in the world as well. However, scientific integrity requires that we should clearly draw attention to the fact that the curricula of history that we present are the old ones that were not developed in 1997 as other subjects because of the lack of new standardized curricula and books as recommended by the development plan in order to achieve national integration. History

curricula have not yet been established because of the political disagreement about them, although the committee in charge of developing the curriculum has reached an advanced formula whereby some textbooks have been authored, but have been withdrawn from circulation after printing. Of course, the consensus on the new and developed history curricula and books has become of utmost urgency, and the Center for Educational Research and Development established has put a lot of work in this regard.

In Geography, the human rights chapter includes "national responsibilities" while the other elements are absent. The same goes for the freedoms. It has the freedom of criticism only while no element of social justice, equality, democracy, education and education on human rights and peace has been addressed. The chapter of conflict is not included in any lesson. Globalization in its economic, political and cultural form is included in the content. All elements of the North and the South were also included in the lessons. When it comes to refugees and migrants, this topic has been addressed because Lebanon is known for the number of the migrants from it to be almost twice the number of its residents. In climate change; global warming and carbon emissions have been addressed, which are global topics and contribute to enlighten learners about their danger. The environment has been addressed fairly, that the ecosystems, biodiversity and desertification have been covered, and all these topics are of global interest and can draw students' attention to what is happening on the globe. In addition to that, there are topics related to natural disasters such as earthquakes, volcanoes, hurricanes and floods because they are a part of geography. Development is also found in the content of the subject textbooks, especially water quality.

Economics, which is taught only in secondary classes, is rich in elements of global citizenship compared to other social studies.

In the human rights chapter, it included all components except for the "indigenous rights". In the chapter of freedom of expression, some of its elements were mentioned. It also included all elements of social justice chapter. It is a good thing for learners to know the meaning of each concept and to be able to use it properly. Equality is included in the content of books in several forms; it even includes all the elements. So is democracy because all the elements of the chapters are available in the texts. This also applies to human rights education, which the books of the subject include all the elements of the chapter. The same goes for the chapter of peace, while the subjects of conflict

were not covered significantly; it was limited to child labor and livelihood crisis, which is normal in Economics. The subject focused on globalization, in both its economic and political aspects, because of their interrelationship. Migration is covered in the lessons because it is related to the economy. The authors went on to include the elements of "North and South" in the lessons of the subject because the economy is the basis of this classification, as well as for refugees and migrants. The same goes for the wars because most wars have economic causes. In the chapter of the environment, the sustainable environment is covered, as well as the natural disasters, volcanoes and hurricanes. As for international companies, they are significantly covered in textbooks in secondary grades with all its elements except for the slavery because Lebanon did not know this phenomenon. Development, which is one of the pillars of economics, was covered in the lessons.

Thus, we find that social studies subjects have included a considerable number of the global citizenship elements in the cognitive domain, which is the basis for the rest of the domains that will be addressed later.

In Science, Mathematics and Informatics, Physics included only four elements of UNESCO's list of domains: In the chapter of "climate change", we find global warming and carbon emissions that are all global events because they include the world as a whole, and their damage is very serious. When students learn about their causes and how to reduce their risk, they will be well equipped to take the next steps in terms of their interest in the topic and contribute to addressing it locally and globally. The fourth element is the sustainable environment, which is related in some way to the content of Physics.

Chemistry has common elements with Physics, and has been limited to a small number within the theme of "climate change", environment and development. Some lessons covered global warming and carbon emissions in grades 7, 8, 9 and 10. The same goes for sustainable environment and water quality, which are becoming global phenomena.

Biology, in the elementary and secondary cycles, includes many elements of global citizenship, in which all human rights are included in one way or another. In freedom of expression chapter, we find "freedom of criticism" and "transparency." In social justice, several elements were also available. Like all elements of democracy, this was not expected because this subject is scientific in its objectives and content, but the authors included topics related to citizenship. In the chapter of the environment,

the lessons included most of its components except for the desertification. In natural disasters, some lessons covered earthquakes and volcanoes. Sustainable development was also mentioned in one of the lessons.

Informatics included economic and cultural globalization in the secondary cycle. This is despite the importance of this subject in the era of technological revolution, which affects the lives of people whether in developed societies or not.

Mathematics, that is included in the table, is devoid of human rights elements, as well as for the other elements except for "gender equality". This was inferred by citing examples of female and male equally.

These science subjects and Mathematics carry information shared by the entire world, although they did not include many elements of global citizenship.

The range of other subjects to be addressed in the cognitive domain is the Arts; Theater did not include any element of global citizenship; which is questionable because Arts in all their forms are universal. Music has two components: the right to learn from the first grade to the sixth grade, and the element of "cultural rights" in the same grades. Fine Arts included the same elements from grades 1 till 12.

With regard to Humanities (Arabic, French, English and Philosophy), the Arabic language included several elements distributed in the following domains: In the Human rights chapter, information about national responsibilities were available in several grades, including twelfth grade, and about international responsibilities in the ninth grade, the rights of the child in the seventh and ninth grade, the rights of women in the ninth grade. The chapter of freedom of expression included a number of elements available in the Arabic language in the eighth grade, and freedom of criticism in the ninth grade. As for the chapter of social justice, the elements of the chapter are available except for old age security, while there is no element of the chapter of equality, while the opposite goes to the chapter of democracy, which the equality is one of its principles! In "Human Rights and Peace Education", basic rights are included in grades 1, 7, 9, and economic rights in 9th grade. The concept and culture of peace, reconciliation and conflict resolution were covered in the texts of the subject. As for globalization, economic globalization was covered, and in migration there were two elements

in the third and eleventh grades. There were two elements of "migrants and refugees" chapter in the books of the subject. In climate change, global warming was covered in one of the lessons. As for the environment, its elements have been addressed in some grades of Primary Education. Sustainable development and Millennium Goals are also included in some lessons. The French language included a good number of information related to global citizenship, such as: In the human rights chapter, the subject deals with the rights of children and women's rights. In freedom of expression, the texts include freedom of media and social communication in grades five and eight, and they include two elements of social justice (the right to proper food and the right to health), while equality and democracy were not addressed. The Secondary Education included the element of "fundamental rights", and the concept and culture of peace were included in the tenth grade. Some elements of the "awareness of the types and causes of conflict" such as physical violence, moral violence, child labor and child exploitation are found in the 11th grade textbooks. The subject also includes the elements of freedom of immigration and movement, and wars. Most elements of the environment chapter are available in the lessons, and the theme of fires in grades four and five. As in the previous two languages, English language contained a significant number of elements of global citizenship.

In the human rights chapter, "international responsibilities", the rights of children and women, and the right to education are included in the third cycle of Primary and Secondary Education. Among the freedoms was the concept of freedom of press and media, and in social justice; there was "social responsibility" in the eleventh grade, while all elements of equality are included in the eleventh and twelfth grades, as well as some principles of democracy. Some of the lessons dealt with teaching human rights and peace education, especially the basic rights for the Secondary Education. The authors seem to have deliberately introduced these concepts to students who now know what is meant by each principle and element. In the chapter of "awareness about the types of conflict", most of the elements were found in the Secondary Education, such as abuse, violence, exploitation and treachery. The rest of the chapters also included relevant elements such as global poverty, wars, migrants, child and women exploitation, which has become a global phenomenon, carbon emissions that harm the global climate, in addition to natural disasters and earthquakes. Most of the elements of the environmental theme were also included in the English language lessons, some of which were generally learned such as desertification.

As for Philosophy and Civilizations, its books included topics related to global citizenship, such as national responsibilities, cultural rights and the right to education in the "human rights" chapter. In

the chapter of freedom of expression, there was freedom of criticism, transparency and freedom of civil work. Some of the elements of social justice chapter were included in the lessons. As for Human Rights education, it was all covered with a few elements of peace education. The rest of the chapters with their elements were not found in the content of the subject. It seems that the three languages and Philosophy subjects taught in the Lebanese schools include many elements relevant to global citizenship so that students learn about the issues that the world is facing, and not a single society.

Thus, the content of the textbooks, which are considered to reflect the content of the Lebanese curriculum, has been surveyed, and it has been found to contain a significant number of global citizenship elements in the cognitive domain. We will move to address the socio-emotional domain in these subjects, following the same sequence.

This domain covers the academic objectives and phrases that have a social or emotional (Affective) significance.

As for the Civics, its books included several elements, which the first appears in the global citizenship (social communication), and Self and Others such as family, community, and country, as well as in the chapters of nationality and identity. The books also included elements of critical thinking such as identifying values and attitudes, identifying principles, and credibility of sources. The subject also included all elements of Disputes and Conflicts, and this is essential for the Lebanese student and their society after the bad conflicts that the country has suffered. These elements can be generalized to extend from local to global context. The same goes to the Cooperation and Acceptance of Others. The rest of the chapters included some elements except for "Global Citizenship Education", a subject that was not in circulation in Lebanon when developing curricula and books, although it started in America in the early 1980s. Sociology included a large number of global citizenship elements as shown in the table above, especially in the themes of global citizenship, Self and Others, identity, critical thinking, dispute, conflict resolution, cooperation and respect for diversity. It is a good thing to provide students with such a wide range of concepts and activities in one subject, all of which contribute to providing them with the necessary knowledge and thus lead to the development of their skills and acquiring them global attitudes and values. However, the subject did not address international solidarity, which is deficient when the focus is on building a better society for the next generation, as well as it includes nothing about global citizenship education. History included a limited number of elements of socio-emotional domain such as the Homeland, nationality and

national identity. As for the Dispute, the subject included all the elements of this chapter, while it did not include any element of the remaining chapters. This is clearly insufficient in educating the learner about global citizenship. The reasons for this lack of new curricula have already been mentioned.

Geography, in turn, contained limited elements of global citizenship. While the content of Self and Others chapter included the family, neighborhood and school, and these are linked to local citizenship. The same goes to personal identity, and the presence of "information analysis", which is actually within the domain of skills and not in the socio- emotional domain. There are four elements that seemed to be directly related to global citizenship: recognition of diversity, global solidarity, international partnership, and global education. Economics is more related to global citizenship because it includes many elements such as global culture and social communication in the global citizenship chapter; and the majority of the elements of "Self and Others" chapter, and nationality and identity, as well as for critical thinking, but these elements disappear when "Disputes", "Conflicts", "Tolerance," and "Global Citizenship Education" are addressed. However, this does not underestimate what was available in the subject, such as international sponsorship and cooperation, and international partnership.

Combining the elements available in Social Studies is an important part of Global Citizenship Education and it includes social and emotional elements.

As for Science, Mathematics and Informatics, their subjects included elements from the socio-emotional domain:

In Physics, there was no element available in this domain. This is questionable about the activities associated with the subject: Doesn't it include anything about society? or the country? or other elements? The same applies to the Chemistry. Some elements must be included in the large number of lessons allocated to each grade from 7th to 12th. The same applies to Biology. Mathematics was slightly better, including two objectives; "information analysis" in all grades, and "identifying attitudes". This domain seems to lack its elements in Science and Mathematics.

Informatics, which is more technological than social, included a few of these elements that have been addressed such as social communication, cultural diversity, analysis of information, and the quality of resources. As for Mathematics, it included two elements: analysis of information and

identification of attitudes only, while it was possible to include more elements in terms of skills or values.

Moving to another field, Arts, it shows that: fine arts included some elements of global citizenship in the chapters of "cooperation and acceptance of others" and "respect of cultural diversity," and it is a small number of what can be included in this subject. Music contained the element of world culture, recognition of diversity, and cultural exchange. This is also limited because music, which is a universal language, is expected to include many elements of this citizenship. Theater includes four elements, namely "Self and Others", "acceptance of others", "cooperation with others", and "dialogue with others".

In general, Arts subjects lack a lot of social and emotional elements because they are the most common subjects that people share without needing a mean of communication such as language. Music is described as a universal language, the arts are valued by people from different cultures, and theatrical work can somehow be understood by those who do not speak the language spoken by actors.

A range of other subjects will be covered to find out what they contain from socio-emotional elements, which are Languages, Philosophy and Civilizations.

The Arabic language contained a good number of elements of global citizenship, such as social communication, since this language is the Mother Tongue of the Lebanese people, and their mean of communication. It also addressed several elements of "Self and Others" chapter, while in the chapter of nationality, it included a part about cultural diversity, and the national identity in the chapter of identity. It also included three elements of the critical thinking chapter, and other three elements of cooperation and acceptance of others in addition to recognition of cultural diversity and values of tolerance.

The French language included elements in most chapters to indicate that it is more global-oriented than the Arabic language. Within the "Self and Others" chapter, it included the majority of its elements, and cultural diversity as well as national identity. It lacked elements of critical thinking, disputes, and conflict resolution to include elements of "cooperation and acceptance of others", "respect for cultural diversity" and "tolerance". The same goes to the English language.

Philosophy and Civilizations included a good number of elements in the socio-emotional domain, especially in the chapter of global citizenship, Self and Others, nationality, identity, critical thinking, "cooperation and acceptance of others", "respect for diversity", "global citizenship education." The subject did not cover "dispute" and "conflict", although covering civilizations must include such topics.

After reviewing the socio-emotional domain and finding out that there is a good number of elements of global citizenship, which can be increased in quantity and quality later, we will move to study the behavioral domain and its elements in these subjects.

Behavioral domain: we begin with Social Studies to maintain the sequence that was followed in this study.

The Civics included all elements of "participation" and most of the elements of "constructive participation". This is a proof that it has not only restricted its content to the national part, but it also has objectives and activities of a global dimension. History did not have a global dimension which is a deficiency that must be fixed later. The same goes to Geography, with the exception of including ideas on "Responsibility towards sustainable development".

Economics is similar to Civics in terms of including several elements in the behavioral domain. It included all elements of "participation", and most of the elements of "constructive participation", except three. There are several elements in Sociology, which is expected because this subject is all about human activity in the local environment initially, and then in the wider environment. Nine out of fifteen elements were included in the secondary cycle, which is a good thing for the sake of educating the students and providing them with objectives related to their behaviors that are appropriate for global citizenship.

Generally, History and Geography lacked behavioral elements, while Civics and Economics included a large number of these elements.

We will move to Science, Mathematics and Informatics, that the above subjects are usually not expected to contain many behavioral elements, thus Physics did not include any of them, and the same applies to Chemistry and Mathematics. The General Science in the elementary cycle and

Biology in the third cycle and secondary education included elements in this domain. The elements of participation are included in the content of all grades, and the "skills and innovation" and "responsibility towards sustainable development" are covered in the content of grades 7, 8 and 11. Informatics did not include any behavioral component, and this does not mean that it is not appropriate for it, but this lack can be fixed when reviewing the curriculum.

As for the Arts, including Fine arts, Music, and Theater, the survey showed that they did not include elements in the behavioral domain, except for one element in fine arts, "skills and innovations", which was mentioned in the seventh, eighth and ninth grades.

For the three languages Arabic, French, English, and Philosophy and Civilizations, the content included some elements in the behavioral domain that the Arabic language included seven elements in this domain, and each element is in more than one grade, which increases its usefulness. But the lack of local participation and active citizen elements reduces the applicability of the rest. The French language included valuable elements such as active participation from the fourth to twelfth grade, and shared other elements with the Arabic language. Among the three languages, it addressed the issue of responsibility for sustainable development. In the English language, there is one element that has been concluded as a general objective within the scope of active participation skills. In Philosophy and Civilizations that is taught in the Secondary Cycle only, the number of behavioral elements is acceptable, which enhances the status of this citizenship among learners, especially since they are no longer young, and some of them will start working or enroll in the university.

The Kindergarten is not reliable a lot regarding global citizenship because the child does not understand local citizenship at the age of 4 or 5. In the socio-emotional domain, most elements are available but at the level of children between the ages of three and five. However, we can say that it is a good thing to introduce some concepts to them - even if they do not understand the meaning of the concept – in order to get used to some practices in their daily lives such as cooperation, tolerance, animal welfare, conflict resolution and other things that happen among them. Most of the behavioral domain elements are available, and these are highly beneficial for their character in order for them to reach higher ranks in the future.

The educational development plan in Lebanon; and the general education curriculum and its objectives, are supposed to convey the parts and objectives of these two documents, but their review is necessary and will be a scientific addition to the report.

These documents are the basis of the textbooks used by the learner primarily, essentially and permanently, and whose content affects their knowledge, social, behavioral and skill competencies. The objectives above are coherent with the cognitive, social, emotional and behavioral domains.

Through the analysis of the content of the development plan created at the beginning of the educational reform in Lebanon, it is found that many elements of the global citizenship domains developed by UNESCO are available. This is despite the fact that the focus of this plan was on the Lebanese citizenship because the country had just experienced a long civil war, and it is normal that educators include several elements of Lebanese citizenship in the curricula and books.

Among the intellectual and humanitarian dimensions of the plan are: "Belief in Lebanon as a homeland for freedom, democracy and justice...; Belief in human values and principles that respect human being and incite education, work and ethics;... Lebanon is a model country for cultural interaction and spiritual and intellectual openness and contradicts the systems and doctrines that are based on racial discrimination and religious intolerance; Lebanon is a country of openness to global cultures, it adapts to the modern developments in a way that does not contradict the Lebanese national heritage, environment and Lebanese values. It is in its openness and its positive participation in the development of these cultures that it enriches them and get enriched "(Development Plan, p. 6). What is mentioned in a small part of the educational development plan in Lebanon responds to a number of elements of global citizenship, as shown in the table above. The educational decision-maker wanted Lebanon's students to be the citizens of the future at the national level, and then at the international level. Otherwise, they would not have addressed concepts of global dimensions such as human values and principles, cultural interaction, spiritual openness, intellectual openness. The decision-maker also wanted to raise the awareness of the new generation against racial discrimination and religious intolerance, which are problems at the local and global levels. This has been repeated elsewhere in national and social dimensions to emphasize its value and commit to it.

Among the general educational objectives: building a citizen who is proud of their homeland Lebanon and of their belonging and loyalty to it; ... aware of the importance of coexistence; ... preserving the

rights and property of others; fluent in at least one foreign language in order to open up to global cultures; promoting the spirit of peace in oneself and in interpersonal relations" (p. 9).

Belonging to the homeland should be considered a step prior to belonging to the world as a whole, because the citizen becomes aware of the relationship between the citizen and the institutions of their state, making it easier for them to understand the relations between their country and global institutions, and gradually becomes able to understand aspects of relations between societies in countries different ethnically, religiously and culturally. This is the purpose of the global citizenship education. Therefore, the development plan included many elements of this type of citizenship, which is expected to play its role in raising awareness about global issues such as contribution to the possibility of addressing them or reducing their harm.

The curricula developed three years after the plan have been largely built upon, as shown in the table. It included many common elements, especially in the general objectives, which were as a repetition of the plan. These objectives are subdivided into secondary objectives to suit all the cycles and subjects.

If we use some of the subjects as an example for including elements of global citizenship education, we find the availability of these elements in some of its own objectives. In the Arabic language, which is the Mother Tongue, "see examples of the World Heritage translated to Arabic, to enrich the learner; ... the role of the Lebanese people in the world culture" (p. 41). The curricula also included subjects that are supposed to be global in their objectives and content, especially social studies such as History, Geography, Civics, Economics and Sociology, but as shown by the analysis of their tables, most of them did not include much about global citizenship. As for the Philosophy and Civilizations, its general objectives included: "get to know the experiences of nations, their lifestyles and ways of thinking and understanding of themselves and their surroundings according to their own standards; and to get to know the diversity of civilizations and their sub-systems and activities in the light of their foundational values and their geographical, historical and cultural frameworks; to know the different civilizations and their movements in history as an integrated human experience "(educational curricula, p. 646). This subject is rich in topics that are global, and encourages learners to explore the components of civilizations that interest them because they will ultimately positively affect their attitudes and actions.

What is being applied in our schools is what has been studied above, which is currently counted on to change the curricula and books, but in addition, work has been carried out on many of supplementary curricula and intervention programs as we will see in detail below.

## **B. Supportive Programs and Supplementary Curricula, and a Plan to Develop Educational Curricula in Conformity with the Terminology of Global Citizenship according to the Curriculum Adopted by UNESCO (2015)**

The survey covered thirteen programs and curricula, including a series of workshops conducted by the Center for Educational Research and Development within the curriculum development plan, namely: Citizenship for Religious Diversity Curriculum, Health Education Curriculum, Gender Reproductive Health Curriculum, Psychosocial Support Program, Child Online Safety Project, Traffic Safety Project, National ICT Strategic Plan for Education, Curriculum Development Workshops into Interactive Curricula (2015 - 2019), Workshop Towards a National Evaluation Strategy - July 2018, Workshop on "Lebanese Learner Profile and domains of Educational Development Plan" - January 2019, Ongoing Training, School Building Specifications and Classroom Equipment, Green Room Activities.

It was found from the quantitative combination of terminology applications in the three domains, that the terms (194) included in the applications, are repeated several times in the survey between one to ten times, which shows that those terms are spread in the supporting supplementary curricula, as in the objectives (general and specific) and in the areas of competencies, the following table shows that:

## **Results of the Terminology Survey:**

Quantitative terminology survey table

Number of repetitions of terms in 12 applications	Cognitive domain terms	Socio-Emotional domain terms	Behavioral domain terms
Repeated 10 times		Analyzing reality, determining values, identifying attitudes, cooperation with others	Moral responsibility towards others
Repeated 9 times		Analysis of information, acceptance of others, dialogue with others	A sense of social responsibility, a sense of human responsibility
Repeated 8 times	Children's rights, non-discrimination (gender, color, look, belief)	Dispute resolution, conflict resolution, values of tolerance	Social and civic participation
Repeated 7 times	National responsibilities, cultural rights, right to education, social responsibility, gender equality, cultural rights, conflict resolution, abuse	Social communication, quality of resources, identification of dispute, causes of dispute, identification of conflict and its causes	Local participation, volunteering, social service, sense of national responsibility, humanitarian acts, social justice
Repeated 6 times	The right to education, transparency or objectivity, equal opportunities, harassment, gender equity, reconciliation, moral violence, bullying at school, cyberbullying, violence based on sexual exploitation, abuse and harassment on the basis of sexual harassment, sustainable development	Self and Others, society, school, type of dispute, recognition of the existence of conflict, means of conflict resolution (diplomatic, judicial), inclusion, recognition of cultural diversity, intercultural dialogue, cultural exchange, rejection of racial discrimination, prevention of intimidation in all its forms, animal welfare, human solidarity	Effective participation skills, skills and innovation, responsibility towards sustainable development
Repeated 5 times	The rights of people with disabilities, freedom of press and media, freedom of social communication, freedom of electronic communication, social benefits, right to healthy food, right to participate, democratic governance, fundamental rights, social rights, concept of peace, culture of peace, material violence, domestic violence, family bullying, violence on the basis of discrimination, child labor, exploitation and marginalization of children, abuse or harassment on the basis of form or color, livelihood distress, food security, inequalities, discrimination, right to live in dignity, epidemics and diseases (Ebola, AIDS), water quality	Neighborhood, national identity, cultural identity, identification of principles, history of disagreement, global education	Active citizen, moral responsibility towards others

Repeated 4 times	International responsibilities, women's rights, freedom of membership in associations and organizations, right to housing, right to work, taking into consideration disparities between gender, decision-making, principles of democracy, values of democracy, Promoting democracy, democratic institutions, political rights, economic rights, benefits of a culture of peace, means of a culture of peace, humanitarian law, global poverty, economic inequality, social inequality, scientific inequality, international conflicts, extremism, exploitation of children and women, global warming, carbon emissions, sustainable environment, ecosystems, biodiversity, biosphere, desertification, risk of extinction of certain creatures, fires	Homeland, beliefs, cultural diversity, personal identity, sexual identity, collective or national identity, linguistic identity
Repeated 3 times	Freedom of establishment of associations and organizations, freedom of criticism, freedom of civil work, right to health, old age security, judiciary, economic globalization, political globalization, cultural globalization, good governance, freedom of migration, and movement of people inside and outside the country, freedom of residence of people inside and outside the country, the relationship between North-South, North-South cooperation, North-South disparities, wars, terrorism, use of children in war, genocide, arms race, nuclear armament, natural disasters, earthquakes and volcanoes, hurricanes and floods, global trade, multinational corporations, the private sector, the legacy of colonialism, the remnants of slavery, and the Millennium Goals	World Culture, Diaspora, Nationality, National Nationality, International Welfare and Cooperation, International Compassion, Global Solidarity, International Partnership, Education for Global Citizenship
Repeated 2 times	Indigenous people rights, arms race, governance, refugees, migrants, displaced persons	Social Responsibility of National Corporate, Social Responsibility of Global Multinational Companies, Fair moral and Commercial Responsibility
Repeated 1 time	Global citizenship, global citizen, family	

**Results of the quantitative survey of the learner profile:** The results of the survey showed the titles included in the application of the "learner profile", which also included 12 subjects of supplementary curriculum and program, and curriculum development plan workshops.

The 50 titles covered in the questionnaire are all available in the subjects of the survey, and in different rates, their frequency ranges between two to 10 times out of a total of 12 applications, and they are coherent with the curricula of global citizenship adopted by UNESCO, in terms of learner acquisition (knowledge, skills and attitudes).

**Educational Objectives Survey Results:** The survey of learning objectives related to global citizenship according to the curriculum adopted by UNESCO (2015), for curricula, programs and development plan, including workshops; it was found in the survey of 11 applications, that all the objectives adopted by UNESCO, have matched the objectives of a number of supplementary curricula and programs, so that it was found that all the objectives of the questionnaire, are available in different rates in the adopted programs and curricula, and some of the objectives may be repeated from one to six times in the 11 questionnaires that covered the objectives of education, which were divided into three domains, the cognitive domain, the socio-emotional domain, and the behavioral domain.

It was found that only two objectives were mentioned once in the application, while an objective was repeated twice, four objectives were repeated three times, 12 objectives were repeated four times, four objectives were repeated five times, and two objectives were repeated six times, and it is normal that the frequency of objectives varies in this way, as the educational objectives are distributed according to the cycles of education, and the age of students.

## First conclusion:

It is evident from the foregoing that the supplementary curricula and the curriculum development plan, are mostly aligned with the global citizenship elements, in the curricula adopted by UNESCO (2015), particularly since the availability of educational terms and objectives in the general survey in high rates for a number of terms and objectives, however, the disparity ratio requires reading the results of each subject separately according to the objectives and outputs of each subject.

Therefore, the survey applications were distributed among three groups, its general objectives are aligned with the orientations of the Center for Educational Research and Development, and they do not contradict with the objectives of the adopted survey:

1. Supplementary Curricula and Programs: Life skills curriculum for reproductive health education from a gender perspective, Curriculum for Inclusive Citizenship for Religious Diversity, Health Education Curriculum, Psychosocial Support Program, Child Online Safety Program and Traffic Safety Program.
2. Educational installations: activities of the Green Room, school buildings specifications and classroom equipment.
3. Strategies and Educational Curriculum Development Workshops: National ICT Strategy in Education, Curriculum Development Workshop to Interactive Curricula (2015 - 2019), Workshop Towards a National Evaluation Strategy - July 2018, Workshop on "Lebanese Learner Profile, and domains of development Plan", Continuous Training Program.

## 1. The First Set: Curricula and Supplementary Programs

### - The Cognitive Domain:

- Curricula and Supplementary programs address life issues which are related to the individual's safety and future, and contribute to the awareness of the individual towards themselves, their community, country, behavior, and commitment to regulations and laws, leading to the comprehension of the sound relationship between oneself and the other. Therefore, there is a number of terms that belong to the cognitive domain.
- **Reproductive Health Curriculum:** A supplementary curriculum integrated into the curricula of Arabic, French and English languages, Civics, Sociology, and Life Sciences. Thus, as we view the educational curricula, we can notice that the content of this curriculum is not available as a part of the school textbook. The following terms related to "Human Rights, Freedom of Expression by all Means, Social Justice, Equality, Democracy, Human Rights Education, Peace Education, Awareness on types and Causes of Conflicts, Globalization issues, Poverty and Food Security Issues, Children and Women Exploitation, Risks of Epidemics/Diseases, and development issues." are available (118 terms - all terms).
- **Citizenship Fostering Religious Diversity Curriculum:** This curriculum was designed according to a clear framework that includes acquiring knowledge, developing skills, encouraging desirable behavior and attitudes, in other words, all available titles take into account knowledge, skills and attitudes. It addresses the direct terminology and not the general headings such as: "National Responsibility, Cultural Rights, Transparency and Objectivity, Social Responsibility, Non-discrimination and Gender Equality, the Concept of Peace, the Culture of Peace, Conflict Resolution, Aspects of Inequality and Issues of Extremism" (11 terms).
- **Health Education Curriculum:** It only addresses issues related to the individual's health and world epidemics. It includes terms related to, "The Right to Health, Food Safety, Child Labor, Living Hardships, Global Poverty, Food Security, Right to Live in Dignity, Epidemics and Diseases, Water Quality" (9 terms).
- **Psycho- Social Program:** It addresses the terms "Child Rights, Gender Equality, Conflict Resolution" (3 terms).
- **Child Safety Online:** Education is linked to the child's physical, mental and psychological well-being and is a shared responsibility of the family, society and the nation. "Child Safety Online" project was launched with the aim of creating a safer environment and raising

awareness on the sound and responsible use of the Internet among children, parents and caregivers. Consequently, the terminology in this project includes the titles on "Social Safety, Social Rights, Justice, Reconciliation, Conflict Resolution, Abuse and Harassment, Moral Violence, the Basics of Sexual Harassment" (10 terms).

- **Traffic Safety Curriculum:** It aims to create traffic awareness among all walks of society across the society by providing the youth with the knowledge, skills, values and attitudes that orient their behavior to become disciplined so they would abide by the traffic laws, regulations, principles and traditions, which contribute to protecting oneself as well as protecting others from the dangers and effects of traffic. This curriculum includes activities dealing with traffic concepts in accordance with modern educational curricula utilizing scientific and pedagogical methods that align with the needs of the child across all cycles of education. It also includes a scope and sequence that targets a variety of activities based on different topics that are age appropriate. The terms included are "Children's Rights", which stem from the Rights of the Child to safety and security while on board of a means of transportation (One term).
- The distribution of the knowledge domain terminology in the first set of the curricula and programs mostly revolve around the following titles: Human Rights, Freedom of Expression, Social Justice, Equality, Human Rights and Peace Education, Awareness of the types of Conflicts, and some fundamental titles on global issues related to: Personal Dignity, and Social Responsibility, while some of the fundamental terms associated with these titles are not included in these programs including (Women's Rights, the Right to Education, and others related to individual freedom). Accordingly, we suggest adding to these curricula a number of terms that are relevant to these titles and have been mentioned separately in a number of programs and at the same time meet the objectives, profile and outcomes.

#### **- Socio-Emotional Domain:**

- **Reproductive Health Curriculum:** The reproductive health curriculum has all the terms that go under the tiles of the emotional domain and are distributed as follows: "Global Citizenship, Self and Others, Nationality, Identity, Critical Thinking, Disputes, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others, Respecting Cultural Diversity, Tolerance, International Solidarity, Education on Global Citizenship." These terms fall within the general and specific objectives of the competencies as well as the competency domains (all terms).
- **Citizenship Fostering Religious Diversity Curriculum:** It addresses the terms under the

following titles "Self and Others, Nationality, Identity, Critical Thinking, Disputes, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others, Respect for Cultural Diversity." In addition to terminology on Values of Tolerance, Rejecting Discrimination, and Human Solidarity" (36 terms).

- **Health Education Curriculum:** It includes terms related to critical thinking (Reality Analysis, Taking a Stance). The terms "Accepting Others, and Animal Welfare" are included as well (4 terms).
- **The Psycho-Social Program:** The following terms are available: "Social Communication, Self and Others, the Community, School, Reality Analysis, taking a Stance, Conflict Resolution, Accepting Others, Cooperation with Others, Dialogue with Others, Values of Tolerance" (11 terms).
- **Child Safety Online:** It contains terms related to the following titles: "Global Citizenship, Self and Others, Critical Thinking, Disputes, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others, Tolerance, Human Solidarity, and Education on Global Citizenship." (29 terms) These terms are related to the general and specific objectives, the competency domains and textbooks.
- **Traffic Safety Curriculum:** There is one term in the curriculum (neighborhood) that is among the traffic safety objectives for moving around in the neighborhood and the streets (one term).
- The distribution of the Socio-Emotional terminology in the first set of the curricula and programs as shown in the results, revolve mostly around the following titles: Global Citizenship, Self and Others, Critical Thinking, Disputes, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others, respect for diversity, tolerance, and international solidarity. Accordingly, we suggest adding to these curricula and supplementary programs, a number of terms especially those that have been mentioned separately in these programs and at the same time meet the objectives, profile and outcomes.

#### **- Behavioral Domain:**

- **The Reproductive Health Curriculum:** It includes all the terms associated with the topics on "Participation and Constructive Engagement" (15 terms). All terms are related to the general and specific objectives and the competency domains.
- **Citizenship Fostering Religious Diversity Curriculum:** It includes the terms associated with "Participation and Constructive Engagement, i.e. Local Participation, Local Participation Skills, Social and Civic Participation, Volunteering, Social Service, Sense of National Responsibility, Sense of Social Responsibility, Sense of Human Responsibility, Moral

Responsibility Towards Others Within One's Community, Humanitarian Acts, and Social Justice" (11 terms). All of these terms are related to the general and specific objectives and the competency domains.

- **Health Education Curriculum:** There are no terms related to the behavioral domain.
- **The Psycho-Social Program:** There are no terms related to the behavioral domain.
- **Child Safety Online:** Under the titles of: Sympathizing with Victims of Cyberbullying, the child safety online curriculum includes terms related to "Constructive Engagement , Sense of Social Responsibility, Sense of Human Responsibility, Moral Responsibility Towards the Other, Humanitarian Acts, Social Justice" (5 terms). These terms are related to the competency domains and the textbook.
- **Traffic Safety Curriculum:** Due to the fact that teaching traffic safety contributes to developing the sense of responsibility, the curriculum includes terminology related to "National Responsibility, Sense of Collective Responsibility, Sense of Humanitarian Responsibility" (4 terms).
- It is evident from the distribution of the behavioral domain terminology in the first set of the curricula and programs that most of them intersect with the related terms on the sense of national, humanitarian and social responsibility, local and global responsibility towards others, humanitarian acts and social justice. Thus, it can be deduced from the information provided that a number of terms can be added to the curricula and supplementary programs, especially terms that have been mentioned in some of these programs separately, and at the same time, meet the same objectives and outcomes.
- Therefore, the terminology available in the supplementary curricula and programs in the three domains despite the fact that they vary from one subject to another, revolve around similar topics. They all fall under the titles: Human Rights, Social Justice, Equality and Non-discrimination, Awareness of Types and Methods of Conflicts, Development, Sense of Responsibility Towards Oneself and Others, Critical Thinking, Cooperation and Accepting others, and Values of Tolerance. These enhance the possibility of integrating many of the terms that are not included in these programs and whose outcomes, objectives and profile intersect with other terms and with the objectives of these curricula and programs.

## 2. The Second Set: Educational Equipment

- The educational equipment deals with two interrelated topics: the practical activities of the Green Room, and the specifications of school buildings and classroom equipment. These two topics complement each other in order to build a model interactive school that is adapted to the requirements of environmental regulations, and the refurbishing of buildings according to the objectives of sustainable development taking into consideration the supplies that cater to the needs and safety of the learners, as well as comply with the requirements of digital technologies, such as platforms and sites that stimulate the active instructional process, and the specifications for green buildings. Once available, these facilities among others contribute to the learner's own worthiness as a global individual, opens doors to interaction with peers across the globe, provide the learner with the chance to demonstrate the ability to express their creative talents, hobbies, and personality like anyone else in the world. Consequently, the objectives of the Green Room is to develop the learner's active and effective participation skills, as well as develop the knowledge and skills necessary for civic culture, engagement in civil and volunteer acts and comprehension of human values shared by others.

## 3. The Third Set: Strategies and Curriculum Development Workshops

"The Center for Educational Research and Development organized a series of workshops related to the development of the Lebanese educational curricula to become interactive curricula. The aim of these workshops is to develop the educational curricula, based on the basic titles and orientations stipulated in the curriculum decree in 1997. Due to the fact that the future learner is the son of the information age and digital interaction and their profile aligns with the age of communication, openness and globalization, it is necessary to design the profile of a global learner, while preserving national authenticity and values, leaving room for analysis, testing and lifelong learning."

This text was part of the preparation for the Curricula Redesign Workshop aiming at a shift into interactive curricula 2015 – 2019.

It is clear from this text that the Center for Educational Research and Development is the authority concerned with developing official educational curricula in Lebanon. In 2015, the Center took a leading step to support UNESCO's global citizenship curricula initiative, which attempted to design "the profile of the global learner". The results of the survey in this set reveal that they were the reason behind the use of most of the terms adopted in the UNESCO Global Citizenship Curriculum.

#### **- The Cognitive Domain:**

- **The National Strategic Plan for ICT in Education:** Within the need for incorporating technology into educational policy, the terms "National Responsibility" and "Rights of People with Disabilities" are included under the title of: Technology for the Service of Individuals with Special Needs as well as the term "The Right to Learn." Under the titles of: Opportunities for Gender Equality in Quality Education, and the Equal Right to Access Technology, the terms associated with "Gender Equality, Gender Equity, Non-discrimination (gender, color, look, belief)" (9 terms).
- **Towards Interactive Curricula Development Workshop 2015-2019:** The topics, sessions terminology, concepts and competencies were addressed in a direct and indirect way in these workshops. Consequently , the terminology listed in the knowledge domain , under the titles "Human Rights, Freedom of Expression for All, Social Justice, Equality, Democracy, Human Rights Education and instruction, Peace Education and Instruction , Awareness on types and means of conflicts , Globalization Immigration , North and South, Wars and Conflict, Migrants and Refugees, Climate Change, Environment, Natural Disasters, Global Companies, Development". All of the above have been addressed in the workshop on curricula development (118 terms) across all grades, general and specific objectives and the competency domains.
- **Towards a National Evaluation Strategy Workshop - July 2018:** The workshop included three dimensional objectives providing short-term objectives, medium-term objectives (studying and proposing a set of criss- cross competencies and subject related competencies), and long-term objectives (contributing to designing a national evaluation strategy). It used a number of terms under the titles: "Human Rights, National Responsibilities, International Responsibilities, Rights of the Child, Cultural Rights, Right to Education. Under the title of: Equality, the terminology used was on: Gender Equality, Gender Equity, Non-discrimination (gender, color, look and belief), Fundamental Rights, Cultural Rights, Refugees,

Sustainable Development" (13 terms) across all grades, general and special objectives and competency domains.

- **The Lebanese Learner's Profile Workshop and the Domains of the Plan for Upgrading the Educational System:** The topics addressed in the workshop sessions include concepts, terminology, and competencies addressed directly and indirectly. So the terminology in the knowledge domain , under the titles: "Human Rights, Means of Freedom of Expression, Social Justice, Equality, Democracy, Human Rights Education and Instruction, Peace Education and Instruction , Awareness on Means and Types of Conflicts , Globalization, Immigration, the North and South, Wars and Conflicts, Migrants and Refugees, Climate Change, Environment, Natural Disasters, Global Companies, and Development". All of these have been fully covered in the workshop on curricula development (118 terms) across all grades, general and specific objectives and domains of the competencies.
- **Teacher Training:** Continuous training provides the teacher with a chance to pursue continuous lifelong academic, educational and professional achievements. This is based on the adoption of active methods at the pre-service level resulting in a competent teacher at the academic and pedagogical levels. This teacher should be familiar with the modern methods of teaching/ learning, paving the way for training curricula which include modern terminology adopted in UNESCO's Curriculum on Global Citizenship that were listed in the knowledge domain, under the titles, "Human Rights, Freedom of Expression, Social Justice, Equality, Democracy, Human Rights Education and Instruction, Peace Education and Instruction, Means and Types of Conflicts, Globalization, Immigration, the North and South, Wars and Conflicts, Migrants and Refugees, Climate Change, Environment, Natural Disasters, Global Companies, Development. These have been fully presented at the Curriculum Development Workshop" (100 terms).

#### **- The Social Emotional Domain:**

- **The National Strategic Plan for Information and Communication Technology in Education:** the terms include "Global Citizenship, Social Communication, Data Analysis, Types of Resources, Resources Credibility and Objectivity, Cooperation with Others, Higher Education, Education on Global Citizenship" (8 terms).
- **Towards Interactive Curricula Development Workshop 2015-2019:** It included all the terms in the socio-emotional domain which are titled, "Global Citizenship, Self and Others,

Nationality, Identity, Critical Thinking, Disputes, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others", Respect for Diversity, Tolerance, International Solidarity, Global Citizenship Education" (57 terms).

- **Towards a National Evaluation Strategy Workshop - July 2018:** The workshop dealt with terms related to topics about "Identity, Critical Thinking, Disputes, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others" (22 terms).
- **The Lebanese Learner's Profile Workshop and the Domains of the Plan for Upgrading the Educational System:** all the terms listed in the socio -emotional domain were included under the titles, "Global Citizenship, Self and Others, Nationality, Identity, Critical Thinking, Disagreements, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others, Respect for Diversity, Tolerance, International Solidarity, Global Citizenship Education" (57 terms).
- **Teacher Training:** according to the results of the survey, the following terms related to topics are used: "Critical Thinking, Disputes, Conflicts, Cooperation and Accepting Others, Respect for Diversity, Tolerance" (29 terms).

#### **- Behavioral Domain:**

- **The National Strategic Plan for ICT in Education:** under the title of ethical and legal use of technology, the following terms are available: "Local Participation, Ethical Responsibility towards the Local Community, Ethical Responsibility towards the Global Community, Skills and Innovation" (4 terms).
- **Towards Interactive Curricula Development Workshop 2015-2019:** This workshop addressed all terms within the field of behavioral domain and under the title of: Participation and Constructive Engagement" (19 terms).
- **Towards a National Evaluation Strategy Workshop - July 2018:** The workshop addressed most of the terms related to the behavioral domain, except those related to International Companies (15 terms).
- **The Lebanese Learner's Profile Workshop and the Domains of the Plan for Upgrading the Educational System:** This workshop dealt with all the terms that fall within the behavioral domain and under the titles on "Participation, and Constructive Engagement" (19 terms).
- **Teacher Training:** The following terms were addressed: "Local Participation, Active Participation Skills, Active citizen, Social and Civic Engagement, Volunteering, Social Service,

Sense of Social Responsibility, Sense of Human Responsibility, Moral Responsibility Towards Others in the Local Community."

- The survey forms show that the national strategy, workshops related to curriculum development, and continuous training are a key lever towards designing a global learner profile, in harmony with the outcomes and objectives of Global Citizenship Education, thus providing chances for the successful integration of global citizenship terminology into National Curricula upon the approval of the official political entities.

## **Suggestions and Recommendations:**

While there are some differences in the definition of the concept, elements and objectives of global citizenship in the literature, the Center for Educational Research and Development reserves the adoption of the concept in absolute terms, but rather the adoption of the term and according to the framework in which it is placed.

- The need to emphasize the manifestation and activation of elements that contribute to the promotion of active citizenship.
- The results of the quantitative survey of the supplementary curricula and the curriculum development plan show that they are mostly consistent with the elements of the Global Citizenship Education Curriculum adopted by UNESCO (2015), and that a large number of terms, learner profile and educational objectives, in the survey are available in different rates across different curricula, programs and subjects as well as in the Plan for Upgrading the Educational System and can therefore be adopted as a starting point for integrating the elements of Global Citizenship Curriculum adopted by UNESCO (2015) into the National General Education Curricula.
- There are many terms in the three domains (cognitive, socio- emotional and behavioral) that have been used in certain curricula and supplementary programs related to the above mentioned basic titles, which show the possibility of adding these terms to those programs and curricula, especially that a number of these terms have been mentioned separately in some but not all programs and curricula, as in case of the Life Skills Curriculum for Reproductive Health Education from a Gender Perspective.
- Some of the new programs rely on determined specific objectives, which are linked to dimensions that are purely with technical characteristics. These programs can achieve more comprehensive

objectives if their plans are in line with the elements of global citizenship, for example: Health Education Curriculum, Citizenship Fostering Religious Diversity Curriculum, Psychosocial Support Program, Children Online Safety, Traffic Safety.

- We recommend installing a green room and adopting its activities across all cycles in each public and private school in Lebanon until the specifications for school buildings and classroom equipment that align with the requirements of the model school are available.
- The National Strategy, along with the workshops related to curriculum development, and the continuous training programs that have been, adopted since 2015, are a key lever towards designing a global and open to the world learner profile, in harmony with the outcomes and objectives of Global Citizenship, as stated in the curriculum adopted by UNESCO (2015), thus providing chances for the successful integration of global citizenship terminology into National Curricula especially as the project to develop the current curriculum noted many features of the learner and common life skills.
- Some of the subjects included many elements related to global citizenship, and these were mentioned, while other subjects clearly lacked these elements, so it is necessary to submit recommendations based on conclusions to address this situation, taking it gradually as stated in the study.
- Regarding the Plan for Upgrading the Educational System , which included a large proportion of the elements of Global Citizenship, it lacks some basic elements such as: "learners develop their understanding of the challenges facing the conflicts in management and conflicts in beliefs and values" as well as other topics that can be added once the plan is modified.
- There are gaps in key aspects related to Global Citizenship elements, such as: "learners develop understanding of governance systems including politics, history and economics"; "learners develop planning skills, analyzing data, and reaching conclusions." This and similar gaps must be filled once curricula are revised.
- If we take a number of subjects in addition to a domain, we can proceed with social studies and the cognitive domain. We refer to the identified gaps in these subjects, especially History (Its curricula and books should be developed as soon as possible) and Geography, in terms of covering and addressing global issues. Therefore, the most important global topics - which are many - should be included in the curricula of these subjects.
- Science, Mathematics and Informatics scarcely covered global citizenship elements. Although these subjects are inherently unable to cover these elements, the approaches and content of these

elements need to be incorporated into science-related topics such as the dangers of using non-peaceful nuclear atoms, and how they can be solved. The serious consequences of chemistry and chemical weapons, on humans could be raised, especially when conflicts occur, linking what the student has acquired with their environment and the lives of other human beings. Informatics, which has become a means of communication among different peoples, needs to highlight this aspect in its use and thus focus on its role in raising awareness and understanding among generations in different societies.

- Art subjects which lack a lot of knowledge must be included in any modification of their curricula, such as Theater Education, which does not address this art at the global level. The same is applicable to Music Education. The limited elements in the Visual Arts require a review of the content of these materials to introduce elements of Global Citizenship.
- Regarding Humanities, language curricula and textbooks lacked many elements of Global Citizenship. Humanities in particular can address world heritage in literature and compare between the various international products shedding light on what mankind has accomplished in this field as stories, poems and other texts greatly influence people's attitudes and values.
- Regarding Philosophy, its texts lacked many elements related to Global Citizenship, especially those on freedoms, with no mention on Democracy, Conflicts and Globalization which are fundamental themes in the twenty-first century and must be included later in this subject.
- What was included in the social studies subjects in the Social Emotional Domain was less than expected, especially in History. This subject which should have been rich in knowledge, must be enriched by social and emotional aspects, especially when dealing with regional and global conflicts in order to focus on the harm they cause to the society' structure and the harmful acts and displacement of innocent people, nuclear danger, and other topics. In other words, curricula and textbooks in these subjects should focus on the importance of values in the learning process. The aim is not only to memorize information, but also to use it to promote these values among learners. The same applies to Geography, which includes topics of a global nature. Values and social aspects associated with these topics should be highlighted as well as those that need to be included in the subject later.
- Regarding Science and Mathematics, which have a few elements from the social and emotional domain, they can include several subjects of a global nature so that the values aspect is integrated into its contents and later on in projects that students are required to execute.

- Arts subjects included socio-emotional elements, but the percentage is small relative to what can be included. Art curricula and publications should be used to enhance values and social aspects as well as educate learners on their importance as arts itself is a universal language that can be understood by all without mastering a foreign language. Elements that support this objective should be added to the curricula.
- In Humanities, languages lacked teaching students about peace and global citizenship, despite the fact that the texts that could be incorporated into these subjects could be universal content wise, allowing for a transition to universal values and vital social topics. Philosophy may include more content on social topics, values and attitudes due to the nature of this subject did not teach students Peace and Global Citizenship, despite the fact that the texts.
- The third domain that needs to be more focused on in the Lebanese curricula and textbooks is the behavioral domain. It is clear that in most subjects related to this domain, there is a lack in learner leadership role which in turn guides learners to become convinced of the importance of participation in public affairs in their country and hence in global issues. In social studies, the focus should be on desertification and how to avoid it through the participation of learners and citizens in addressing this problem, combating armaments by expressing anti-armament declarations through several peaceful and civilized means. Lessons and activities that show the devastating danger of nuclear arms race to humanity should be included.
- Science and Mathematics subjects do not include many elements of this domain. As noted above, topics of a global nature may be added or a number of topics included in the texts could be adapted to become activities that address global topics. These would convince learners to be involved in many global issues on preserving the environment and living things in danger of extinction, water hygiene, and health care at the local and global levels. Here, it is worth mentioning that the Community Service Project conducted by the Center for Educational Research and Development, has started at the Ministry of Education in 2016.
- The Arts within the three subjects included one element: "Skills and Innovations". This field should be rich in various domains, but it has shown to be focusing less on Global Citizenship. Subsequently, its curricula should include elements from different domains, including the behavioral domain.
- Humanities Subjects should include motivating topics that encourage learners to take part locally in social issues. It is then that they can proceed to care for worldwide issues and participate through writing articles that address any topic beyond the homeland.

It should also be noted that more attention should be paid to the teaching methods that are one of the elements of the curriculum, through making the learner the center of the educational process and helping him/her to develop his/her cognitive skills in particular (such as Critical Thinking) in order to become mostly an initiator and not only a passive recipient of what is being taught. Modern teaching methods provide opportunities to learners to raise topics related to their learning in the classroom during sessions, and these include elements of global citizenship. Furthermore, the teacher has a role in motivating learners to discuss these topics, whether within the taught curriculum or beyond it.

In conclusion, with regard to the languages and humanities curricula and their role in global citizenship education, we return to recall that the presence of a full chapter that focuses on the practice of expression techniques in the curricula of the Arabic language and a fixed chapter in the secondary cycle included in the official exams, is to study the full impact of world literature such as Tagore and Goethe and others that benefit global citizenship Education, as well as the fact that multilingualism is used in the Lebanese curriculum in this regard, through the study of texts and literary effects in French and English in order to ensure this upbringing on the world heritage and openness to the cultural and human dimension, thanks to education and its role in the convergence and dialogue of civilizations.



# Global Citizenship Education Curriculum Development & Integration

Situational Analyses  
under the 2<sup>nd</sup> Round Project

## LEBANON



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization

### APCEIU

Asia-Pacific Centre of  
Education for International Understanding  
Under the auspices of UNESCO

RÉPUBLIQUE LIBANAISE  
 CRDP  
Centre de Recherche  
et de Développement  
Pédagogiques