

Global Citizenship Education
Curriculum Development & Integration
Situational Analyses under the 2nd Round Project

GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP CONCEPTS IN THE CURRICULUM OF **LEBANON:**

ANALYSIS AND INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS

Ghada Awada, Lebanese American University

GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP CONCEPTS IN THE CURRICULUM OF LEBANON:

ANALYSIS AND INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS

Publisher



Asia-Pacific Centre of Education for International Understanding under the auspices of UNESCO (APCEIU) is a UNESCO Category 2 Centre established in 2000 by the Agreement between the Government of the Republic of Korea and UNESCO. APCEIU is mandated to promote Education for International Understanding (EIU) and Global Citizenship Education (GCED) towards a culture of peace with UNESCO Member States. In particular, APCEIU has been supporting GCED curriculum development and integration across the globe since 2016.

Author

Ghada Awada, Lebanese American University

© APCEIU 2019

All rights reserved.

Contact

Office of Research and Development, APCEIU
120, Saemal-ro, Guro-gu, Seoul, Republic of Korea, 08289
Tel: (+82-2) 774-3981, Fax: (+82-2) 774-3958
www.unescopaceiu.org
rnd@unescopaceiu.org

Disclaimer

The ideas and opinions expressed in this report are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent the views of the APCEIU. The author is responsible for the choice and presentation of facts contained in this publication. The maps, pictures, and symbols presented do not imply any opinion on the part of APCEIU.

Global Citizenship Education
Curriculum Development & Integration
Situational Analyses under the 2nd Round Project

GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP CONCEPTS IN THE CURRICULUM OF LEBANON:

ANALYSIS AND INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS

Ghada Awada, Lebanese American University

Contents

Summary	5
1. Introduction	7
2. Purpose of the Report	9
3. Background	9
4. Methodology for Analysis	11
5. Findings	16
5.1 Findings for Education Reform Policy (1995)	16
5.2 Findings for Civics and National Education Curriculum by school level	18
5.3 Findings for English Language and Literature Curriculum by school level	21
5.4 Findings for Math Curriculum by school level	23
5.5 Findings for Science Curriculum by school level	24

5.6 Findings for Arabic Language and Literature Curriculum by school level	25
5.7 Findings for ICT reform in 2012	26
5.8 Evidence of GCED Integration from MEHE and CERD Initiatives	27
5.9 Findings from pertinent studies investigating teaching human rights in Lebanese Civics textbooks	28
6. Conclusion	29
7. Recommendations	30
8. Final Thoughts	30
References	35
ANNEX A	36
ANNEX B	37

Summary

This report provides an analysis of the presence of concepts associated with Global Citizenship Education (GCED) in the aims and content of the Lebanese national curriculum. In particular, this analysis reviews the subject curricula of English Language as a First Foreign Language, Arabic Language, Science, Mathematics, and Civics and National Education from grade 1 through 12. Furthermore, the analysis entails a review for the 1995 educational reform plan, 1997 national curriculum goals, 2011- 2012 ICT reform strategy, studies conducted by CERD in 2017 and 2018, online safety, road safety, psycho-social-supportive curriculum and resources and surveys about national curricula: TIMSS and PISA. We applied the coding scheme for GCED developed by the International Bureau of Education (IBE), derived from UNESCO's definitions of GCED. We applied a coding scheme for GCED developed in 2017, in collaboration between IBE-UNESCO and the Asia-Pacific Centre of Education for International Understanding (APCEIU). The IBE coding scheme is focused on civics/citizenship education. In addition, two other UNESCO coding schemes are applied in order to analyse the presence of a somewhat wider range of GCED concepts. This report also contains some preliminary recommendations and suggestions for how GCED might be strengthened in Lebanon's educational system, considering the findings of this analysis as well as the general aims and learning goals for Lebanon's schooling system and national planning documents.

GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP CONCEPTS IN THE CURRICULUM OF LEBANON: ANALYSIS AND INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Introduction

Lebanon has been amidst an educational reform since the end of the Civil War in 1989. The main goals of the reform focused on addressing issues of identity and belongingness, citizenship and quality education for all, harmonious and peaceful living, and openness to other cultures based on the human values of democracy, justice, and respect for diversity. The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) and the Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD) have devised a new educational ladder, developed new curricula for all 13 school subjects, prepared new textbooks and teaching and learning materials (TLMs), and implemented massive teacher training campaigns that covered all the districts of Lebanon. More recently, MEHE and CERD have attempted to revise the curricula and textbooks in light of accumulated lessons and based on modern international educational trends for effective teaching and learning and sustainable development.

Along similar lines, UNESCO has proclaimed GCED as a key component of the 21st century education for Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the 2030 Education agenda. GCED also supersedes and integrates previous approaches supported by UNESCO to promote education for international understanding, cooperation and peace, and education relating to human rights and fundamental values. Given that the goals of Lebanon's educational reform are in line with the proclaimed UNESCO vision as articulated through GCED, it is important to conduct a GCED situational analysis in order to identify what GCED aspects have been targeted and achieved in the Lebanese educational system and determine areas for improvement and further attention.

GCED is conceptualized as a form of transformative education that seeks to educate citizens in the competencies to actively and responsibly participate in all dimensions of societal development at

local, national and global levels. Global citizenship refers to “a sense of belonging to a broader community and common humanity” and highlights “political, economic, social and cultural interdependency and interconnectedness between the local, the national and the global. GCED entails the following three domains of learning: cognitive, socio-emotional, and behavioral” (UNESCO, 2017, p. 6). As such, GCED aims to develop citizens who respect cultural diversity, practice intercultural understanding, and are competent in intercultural communication and cooperation; GCED also promotes critical awareness and understanding of the causes of global, national and local conflicts, including the interconnection of global structures and national and local realities; and empowers citizens to engage in personal and social action to build a just, peaceful, tolerant, inclusive, secure and sustainable world” (UNESCO, 2017, p. 10).

This report is especially important at this point in time given that Lebanon faces numerous challenges related to the large influx of Syrian refugees in addition to other contextual challenges which impact the entire world and underscore the importance of GCED goals and objectives for modernizing the educational system and surmount challenges. These challenges include growing contradictions and widening inequalities at the national and global levels. According to UNESCO (2017), “although there have been fewer wars between nation states in the recent past, armed conflicts within countries have increased, resulting in a significant rise in the number of refugees and internally displaced people. Other forms of violence, such as domestic violence, criminal assault, child abuse and bullying are a growing problem in many societies. There is also evidence of worsening mental health and a diminution of ‘inner peace’, reflected in increasing global rates of anxiety, addiction, depression and suicide” (p. 7).

2. Purpose of the Report

The main purpose of this report is to assist the Lebanese government in identifying avenues for integrating GCED through its formal curriculum and educational programs. Key policy documents, particularly the Plan for Educational Reform (1994-1995) and the New Framework for Education (1995) have been developed, followed by numerous interventions including writing new textbooks and devising curricula. Based on a systematic situational analysis of the status of GCED objectives and practices in Lebanon, this report will provide evidence-based facts and insights and recommendations for integrating GCED in the Lebanese educational system. Specifically, the report aims to:

1. To review the position of GCED within Lebanon's educational system, particularly within the curriculum, in order to explore and conceptualize to what extent educational policies, curricula, and used teaching and learning materials (TLM's) reflect GCED constructs and outcomes.
2. To assist the Lebanese government in identifying venues for integrating GCED through its formal curriculum and educational programs.

3. Background

This report is prepared in context of the work of the UNESCO on GCED and how Lebanon needs to focus on building a GCED culture among its citizens. It is particularly important that this study is situated in Lebanon at a time when the Middle East, and indeed the entire world is facing the biggest refugees' crisis since World War II. The inability of the Lebanese to accept the diversity and plurality of the Lebanese society resulted in the outbreak of civil war which ended by the virtue of Taif accord which called for adopting a new curriculum integrating human rights education (HRE) in one school subject, namely civics in 1989. Yet, now as a proactive measure which should help the Syrian refugee children to be mainstreamed into the Lebanese society on the one hand and to enable them to get along with the Lebanese children on the other hand, we believe that a new curriculum reform integrating GCED in most school subjects and not only in civics is needed.

In the Lebanese Constitution that was amended by virtue of Taif accord in 1989, political leaders committed to the promotion and protection of fundamental human rights and freedoms (Republic of Lebanon, 1989), values that are foundational to GCED. In this respect, aspects of GCED may

be familiar to member states. Despite the promotion of GCED as an integrating umbrella (as with Education), Lebanon incorporates citizens of 18 sects adopting different religions and beliefs, which led to the outbreak of a civil war (1975–1990) rendering traumatic effects to many Lebanese irrespective of their confessions (Haugbolle, 2005). The 1997 curriculum was reformed upon the end of the civil war, and it helped unite the Lebanese again to a certain extent after incorporating HRE only in the civics textbooks and adopting the communicative approach. Thus, the 1997 reformed Lebanese curriculum was a real, practical resolution representative of the several main sects of Lebanon since it could unify the Lebanese as ‘...The 1989 Taif Agreement, which put an end to 15 years of civil war in Lebanon, initiated a major education reform and called for the creation of a new curriculum that promotes national unity amongst the various religious and political groups in Lebanon’ (Shuayb, 2015, p. 135).

As such, the Taif accord signed by the Lebanese political leaders in 1989 called for the integration of HRE in the curriculum and textbooks of one school subject, namely civics to teach tolerance and peace culture. Now in 2019, Lebanon is still witnessing a tremendous influx of Syrian refugees. The outbreak of civil war in Syria resulted in having many Syrian students enrolled in Lebanese public and private schools. However, many Lebanese are facing problems with the Syrian refugees as ‘...many of Lebanon’s political factions and paramilitary groups are closely related to or directly involved in events in Syria, and Lebanese state institutions are known for their scarce capacity for the provision of essential services and security even to Lebanese nationals’ (Dionigi, 2016, p. 6).

Employing the whole-school approach and the transformative model could transform the Lebanese curriculum and the textbooks in a way that could build a culture of peace, tolerance, democracy, and citizenship. The whole-school approach focuses on integrating GCED into the curriculum and teaching materials that could help teachers incorporate HR subjects into their teaching practices; teacher training should also incorporate human rights values (Amnesty International, 2012). The HRE transformative model also intends to empower learners through raising human rights awareness and prevention of human rights violations (Tibbitts & Kirchsclaeger, 2010). A GCED-based curriculum is needed since ‘...the critical transnational curriculum can offer newcomer students important preparation for life, post-secondary transitions, and the development of a critical understanding of social inequalities and civic participation’ (Bajaj & Bartlett, 2017, p. 33).

The present report sheds light on the GCED good practices that have been implemented in Lebanon to ensure having good GCED practices needed to address the tremendous Syrian influx into Lebanon. In 1997, human rights values and beliefs formed the theoretical and conceptual framework to bring together the diverse sectarian, confessional, and political Lebanese groups who spent over 15 years fighting each other (Awada, Diab & Faour, 2018). Now in 2019, Lebanon has already witnessed an influx of more than 1.2 million Syrians since 'Lebanon is one of the most obvious destinations for Syrians trying to escape the civil war, and around 1.2 million have registered there with the UNHCR. Thus, the Lebanese school curricula should integrate GCED focused on accepting diversity, building peace, democracy and citizenship as well as utilizing the whole-school approach and the transformative model in order to develop awareness of citizenship, democracy and tolerance needed to mainstream the Syrian refugees into the Lebanese schools. The MEHE in Lebanon held a conference to launch the curriculum reform project in 2016.

4. Methodology for Analysis

The methodology used in data analysis and reporting in this report is based on the “domains”, “sources”, and “analytical categories” proposed by UNESCO to assist governments in integrating GCED into educational systems and used by participating countries in the project. Domains span learners’ cognitive, attitudinal (socio-affective), and behavioural development. The sources pertain to selected country key documents available in English and Arabic. These include educational decrees /policies and planning documents, as well subject-specific curriculum that might each contain elements reflecting GCED and emerging in:

- Overall educational or learner goals for a schooling system established for basic education or differing levels of schooling (e.g. primary, lower secondary, upper secondary);
- Learner goals, outcomes, or content established for specific subjects;
- Learner goals, outcomes, or content established for whole school or co-curriculum activities in schools; and
- Goals or content of curriculum supports, such as learner assessment, textbooks and teacher training.

In conducting the analysis to prepare this report, we used the IBE-UNESCO analytical framework in order to look for evidence of GCED in Lebanon's selected key documents under review. The IBE-UNESCO indicator framework concentrates on concepts linked with civics and citizenship education and is designed to be used with subjects that address these explicitly. The application of this framework provides relatively greater insight into the opportunities for integrating GCED into civics and citizenship education subject matter.

GCED is defined by UNESCO as '...a framing paradigm which encapsulates how education can develop the knowledge, skills, values and attitudes learners need for securing a world which is more just, peaceful, tolerant, inclusive and sustainable' (UNESCO, 2015a, p. 9). Given the importance of GCED to the UN and its member states, UNESCO has promulgated numerous documents to assist governments in conceptualising GCED and strengthening the presence of GCED within curriculum. These documents, and the approach incorporated within this Lebanon case study, recognise three domains of potential learner outcomes: cognitive, attitudinal (socio-affective), and behavioural. The analytical frameworks that were applied for this case study incorporated all three domains.

Concerning text-based sources, educational laws, policies and planning documents, as well subject-specific curriculum might each contain elements reflecting GCED. GCED might emerge:

- 1) as part of the overall educational or learner goals for a schooling system established for basic education or differing levels of schooling (e.g., primary, lower secondary, upper secondary);
- 2) as learner goals, outcomes, or content established for specific subjects;
- 3) as learner goals, outcomes, or content established for whole school or co-curriculum activities in schools; or
- 4) as goals or content of curriculum supports, such as learner assessment, textbooks, and teacher training.

The sources pertain to selected country key documents available in English and Arabic. These include educational decrees/policies and planning documents, as well subject-specific curricula that might each contain elements reflecting GCED and emerging in:

- Overall educational or learner goals for a schooling system established for basic education or differing levels of schooling (e.g. primary, lower secondary, upper secondary);

- Learner goals, outcomes, or content established for specific subjects;
- Learner goals, outcomes, or content established for whole school or co-curriculum activities in schools; and
- Goals or content of curriculum supports, such as learner assessment, textbooks and teacher training.

In this report, the subject matters analysed were the thematic curriculum.

- English Language
- Arabic Language
- Civics
- Mathematics:
- Science
- Education reform policy (1995)
- ICT reform policy/The Ministry of Education and Higher Education Strategic Planning Development Report (2012)
- Ministry of Education and Higher Education Members of the Executive Committee report (2013)
- Paper commissioned by the UNESCO Education Sector (2017)
- CERD 2018 Study
- Workshops (2017): Innovative National Curricula

These were logical choices for the civics-oriented approach of the IBE-UNESCO analytical framework (presented in the next section), and for other dimensions of GCED addressed in other UNESCO GCED frameworks, based on the 2015 publication *GCED: Topics and Learning Objectives* (UNESCO, 2015a).

Analytical categories: This report applies the IBE-UNESCO analytical framework used in the cross-country analysis of GCED in civics and citizenship education. The 22 indicators associated with this framework are presented more fully in Table 1.

TABLE 1.

MATRIX FOR CODING CATEGORIES OF CURRICULUM CONTENTS ON GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP AND ASSOCIATED CONCEPTS (IBE-UNESCO, 2017a, p. 14)

<p>I. Justification and general orientations about GCED.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Justification of GCED (socio-economic, political, cultural, moral). 2. Global Citizenship (affirmation; characterization).
<p>II. Cognitive domain categories.</p> <p><i>Global systems, structures and processes:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Global governance system, structures (institutions) and processes. 4. Humanitarian law, human rights, peace building, rule of international laws. 5. Trans-national corporations. 6. Other (global systems). <p><i>Global issues:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 7. Globalization (socio-economic, political, cultural). 8. North-south relationships, developed-developing interconnections, interdependence. 9. Climate change, biodiversity, sustainable development. 10. Global poverty, global inequality. 11. Genocide, terrorism, war, refugees. 12. Diseases (Ebola, HIV & AIDS). 13. Other (global issues).
<p>III. Attitudinal (socio-affective) domain categories.</p> <p><i>Multiple identities:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 14. Humanity as privileged referent of identity. 15. Nation as privileged referent of identity 16. 'Embedded identities': local, national, regional (supra-national), and global. <p><i>Difference and respect for diversity:</i></p> <p><i>multicultural and/or international contexts-levels:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 17. Intercultural empathy, dialogue, respect, solidarity (referred to intercultural or international, regional or world-wide contexts). 18. Discrimination, racism. (Referred to intercultural or international, regional or world-wide contexts). 19. Values and attitudes for Global Citizenship.
<p>IV. Behavioral domain categories.</p> <p><i>Engagement, participation, actions:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 20. Current and future participation in civic protest on global issues. 21. Information and debates on socio-political issues of global reach. 22. Direct action on issues of global reach.

The IBE-UNESCO indicator framework concentrates on concepts linked with civics and citizenship education, which might be found within the civics subject as well as in Moral/Values education. The application of this framework provides relatively greater insight into the opportunities for integrating GCED into civics and citizenship education subject matter.

The IBE-UNESCO framework was derived from UNESCO's *Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives* (2015a, pp. 29, 31), which contains key learning outcomes, key learner attributes, and topics (see Annex A).

The broad set of learning objectives contained in UNESCO's 2015 GCED publication and the subsequent work of the GCED-WG team place a relatively stronger emphasis on attitudinal/socio-affective outcomes, such as shared values. These frameworks also contain skills not exclusive to GCED (though perhaps essential for its realisation) such as critical thinking, problem-solving, and conflict resolution. The application of these frameworks in the Lebanon report allow us to consider a wider range of curriculum approaches for promoting GCED holistically within the national curriculum. Annex B presents the initial GCED-WG competencies.

The final indicator framework was developed by IBE-UNESCO for application with the Global Education Monitoring Report. This framework was used for assessing the presence of SDG 4.7 and has a specific added value in allowing us to identify a range of concepts that can be seen as directly linked with GCED though not necessarily found in civics or citizenship education curriculum. Topics such as peace, human rights, gender equality, health, and sustainable development could conceivably emerge in other curriculum areas. The SDG 4.7 indicator framework also allows us to take into account references to student-centred teaching and learning approaches and assessments that would be essential supports for realising the GCED ethos.

Limitations: In regards to text-based resources consulted for this report, only those accessible to the author or the APCEIU team at the time of report preparation were reviewed. In this report, we look closely at the subjects of civics, Arabic, mathematics, curriculum reform document, ICT education reform, workshops, pertinent studies and reports such as PISA report, science and English., policy documents, particularly the Plan for Educational Reform (1994) and the New Framework for Education (1995). However, it is evident that there are other subjects that can contribute to GCED.

We also recognise that the integration of GCED within a national curriculum cannot be comprised of only one subject matter. Certain GCED concepts, attitudes, and behaviours would ideally be integrated transversally across many subject areas. Moreover, school-wide and co-curricular (meaning non-formal education) practices might also offer key supports to meeting GCED learning objectives.

Though such approaches can provide a vital support for effective GCED, these were not addressed in the curriculum analysis. However, Lebanon's curriculum, which can be viewed as a transversal integration of attitudes and values, received some attention in this report. Based on a systematic situational analysis of the Lebanese case, this report will provide evidence-based insights and recommendations for integrating GCED in the Lebanese educational system.

5. Findings

5.1 Findings for Education Reform Policy (1995)

The Education Reform Policy was articulated in the *Plan for Educational Reform* (1995) intended to operationalize implementation of new educational ladder introduced a year earlier in 1994.

Table 2 displays the GCED and *Lebanese Plan for Educational Reform* Goals and Topics

TABLE 2.

GCED AND LEBANESE LEARNING GOALS *FOR LEBANESE PLAN for EDUCATION REFORM*

(X=direct link; -- = indirect but supportive link)

LEARNING GOAL, BY GRADE*	RELATIONSHIP TO GCED	Global approach to citizenship (IBE-UNESCO, 2016a)	Traditional approach to civics and / or moral education	Grades / Topics
Coordination between the needs of the Lebanese society and labor market"		-- (#2)		
Lebanon model state of interaction of civilizations and spiritual and intellectual freedom, which is contradictory to the doctrines, beliefs and regimes based on human discrimination and religious fanaticism the homeland of openness to international cultures		-- (3 ; 4)		
Lebanon is an active and an establishing member of both ' The Arab league' and ' the United Nations Organization' abiding by their rules and by the 'universal Declaration of Human Rights'		-- 2; 3; 7; 8)		

The analysis shown in Table 2 above indicates that reform policy stressed "coordination between the needs of the Lebanese society and labor market" (p. 9) on one side and education and teaching on the other side. Another indicator of GCED in the proclaimed Education Reform Policy (1995) is highlighting that Lebanon is a "Model state of interaction of civilizations and spiritual and intellectual freedom, which is contradictory to the doctrines, beliefs and regimes based on human discrimination and religious fanaticism" (Education Reform Policy, 1995, p. 11) Also, the Education Reform Policy (1995) has linked Lebanon to its Arabian origin as "the homeland of openness to international cultures" (p. 11). Furthermore, the Policy asserts Lebanon as " ...an active and an establishing member of both 'The Arab league' and 'the United Nations Organization' abiding by their rules and by the 'universal Declaration of Human Rights' (p. 11). These reform aspects may correspond to the GCED components pertaining global citizenship values and governance systems according transnational cooperation, based interdependence and common cultural and moral values. However, the reform policy components do not address a number of GCED indicators particularly those in the socio-affective and behavioral domain categories which call for engagement and participation in direct actions on issues of global reach.

5.2 Findings for Civics and National Education Curriculum by school level

Source: *Civics and National Education Curriculum Decree # 36/M/1998*

Background: The Lebanese curricula include a subject called *Civics and National Education Curriculum* for grades 1-12 (The years of Basic Education: 1-9 and Secondary Education: 10-12). The Introduction to the *Civics and National Education Curriculum* presents the content details and general objectives, activities and materials, teaching methods, and evaluation techniques and procedures to be followed in curriculum implementation. Furthermore, the Introduction highlight many of the GCED domains particularly regarding moral and human values, global developments, democratic values, participatory citizenship, openness, and human brotherhood irrespective of gender, racial, religious, language, or ethnic differences.

The following number of lessons is allocated per week for each grade:

Grades 1-3 (Cycle I of Basic Education): 1 lesson per week

Grades 4-6 (Cycle II of Basic Education): 1 lesson per week

Grades 7-9: (Cycle III of Basic Education): 1 lesson per week

Grades 10- 12 (Secondary Cycle): 1 lesson per week

Analysis: We applied the GCED / IBE-UNESCO indicator framework in analysing the Lebanese *Civics and National Education Curriculum*. Within this curriculum we found numerous themes that link with the GCED IBE-UNESCO indicators, both directly and indirectly.

Specifically, key topics such as Nature and Environment; Lebanon and the Arab World; Education Work, and Professions; Freedom and Rights; Human Social and Democratic Values; Civic Life and Democracy; International Organizations; and General Issues and Social Problems are quite evident in the Grade 1-9 (Basic Education) scope and sequence of the curriculum. Likewise, topics and themes related to Human and Democratic Values; Justice and Jurisdiction; Work Ethics; Arab Solidarity and Cooperation; UN and State Relations; and Urban Planning constitute the curricular content and focus of the *Civics and National Education Curriculum* at the secondary level.

Table 3 below displays the GCED and Lebanese *Civics and National Education Curriculum* Learning Goals and Topics by Grade Levels, 1-9

TABLE 3.

GCED AND LEBANESE LEARNING GOALS FOR CIVICS AND NATIONAL EDUCATION CURRICULUM, GRADES 1-9 ¹

(X=direct link; -- = indirect but supportive link)

LEARNING GOAL, BY GRADE*	RELATIONSHIP TO GCED	Global approach to citizenship (IBE-UNESCO, 2016a)	Traditional approach to civics and/or moral education	Grades / Topics
Discovers connection between home and social and geographic milieu through neighborhood relations		-- (#2)	X	Grade 2, Topic 1: Child Home and Environment
Participates in community activities (cleaning, entertainment, meetings, social gatherings)		-- (#2)	X	Grade 2, Topic 2: Family and Community
Discovers diversity in class and deals respectfully, positively, and equally with boys, girls, and people of different color, physical conditions, and social status		X (# 4, # 16, # 17, #18)	X	Grade 2, Topic 4: We and Other
Participates in conflict resolution to facilitate teamwork based on the values of fairness, justice, and common good.		-- #18	X	Grade 5, Topic 1: Teamwork
Know the steps of the election process from candidacy to declaration of results		X (#3)	X	Grade 5, Topic 3: Elections
Compares domains of using science for peace and wars and realize the importance of science in peace		-- (#13)	X	Grade 5. Topic 5: Science in Serving Humanity
Know institutions that provide social protection for all citizens in various domains and the nature of its work and the services it provides		-- (#3)	X	Grade 8, Topic 1: Citizen rights, duties, and social and economic responsibilities
Recognizes the importance of the state through its functions for maintaining internal and external security, spreading justice, and providing care for all citizens		-- (#3)	X	Grade 8, Topic 5: Public Institutions and Functions
Develops positive attitude towards all professions and not only highly paid high social status ones.		-- (#7, #10, #13)	X	Grade 8, Topic 7: National Values and Cultural Heritage

¹ Non-comprehensive list of topics and related themes. Those presented are linked directly or indirectly with GCED, as defined by the indicators presented in the Methodology section of this report.

The preceding analysis suggests that the Basic Education *Civics and National Education Curriculum* focuses mainly on the GCED domains of humanitarian law, human rights, peace building as well as discrimination, racism, and intercultural empathy and respect. Meanwhile, a number of domains, particularly those pertaining to engagement, participation, and civic protest issues as well as debates on socio-political issues, direct actions on issues of global reach and systems are not addressed.

Table 4 below displays the GCED and Lebanese *Civics and National Education Curriculum* Learning Goals and Topics by Grade Levels, Secondary Education

TABLE 4.

GCED AND LEBANESE LEARNING GOALS FOR CIVICS AND NATIONAL EDUCATION CURRICULUM, GRADES 10-12 ²

(X=direct link; -- = indirect but supportive link)

LEARNING GOAL, BY GRADE*	RELATIONSHIP TO GCED	Global approach to citizenship (IBE-UNESCO, 2016a)	Traditional approach to civics and/or moral education	Grades/ Chapters
Know various means of expressing human values and their varieties across peoples		X (#2, #7, 13)	X	Grade 11, Topic 1: Human Values and Democracy
Understand concepts of justice, fairness, truth, and legitimacy of laws and regulations		X (#3, #17, #18)	X	Grade 11, Topic 2: Law and Justice
Know the work ethics concept as reflection of human and democratic values		X # 1		Grade 11, Topic 3: Work Ethics
Know about common cooperative projects (agricultural, industrial, educational, cultural, and defense)		X (# 2, # 5)		Grade 11, Topic 4: Arab Aspirations and Cooperation
Understand the manifestations of state conflicts and their various causes		X (#4,)	X	Grade 11, Topic 5: State Relations and Role of the UN
Recognize the role of international and regional organizations in dealing with conflicts and promoting peace		X (#3, #4)	X	Grade 11, Topic 5: State Relations and Role of the UN

² Non-comprehensive list of topics and related themes. Those presented are linked directly or indirectly with GCED, as defined by the indicators presented in the Methodology section of this report.

The above table suggests the while the Lebanese Secondary *Civics and National Education Curriculum* does address the GCED indicators pertaining to global citizenship values and attitudes as well as those indicators related to systems of governance (institutional structures, processes, peace building, transnational cooperation), it does not address the behavioural domains of the GCED categories, particularly engagement, participation, protest on global issues, information and debates on socio-political issues, and direct actions on issues of global reach.

5.3 Findings for English Language and Literature Curriculum by school level

Source: *English Language and Literature Curriculum Decree # 33/M/1998*

Background: The Lebanese curricula include a subject called *English Language and Literature* for grades 1-12 (The years of Basic Education: 1-9 and Secondary Education: 10-12). The Introduction to the *English Language and Literature* presents the content details and general objectives, activities and materials, teaching methods, and evaluation techniques and procedures to be followed in curriculum implementation. The curriculum follows a theme-based approach and focuses on “cultural understanding and appreciation” as one the seven goals along with those goals pertaining to the four language skills (Listening, Reading, Writing, Speaking, Critical Thinking, Study Skills). In addition, the curriculum specified number of themes that relate to the GCED domains objectives.

Analysis: We applied the GCED / IBE-UNESCO indicator framework in analysing the Lebanese *English Language and Literature* Within this curriculum we found numerous themes that link with the GCED IBE-UNESCO indicators, both directly and indirectly.

Specifically, key topics (Themes) such as such as: Community Helpers, World Events and Issues, Current Issues, Democracy, Human Rights, Human Values, Ecological Environment, Political Systems, and Women Issues are quite evident in the Grade 1-9 (Basic Education) and the Secondary Education scope and sequence of the *English Language and Literature curriculum*.

Table 5 below displays the GCED and Lebanese *English Language and Literature Curriculum* Learning Goals and Topics by Grade Levels, 1-9

TABLE 5.

GCED AND LEBANESE LEARNING GOALS FOR *English Language and Literature* CURRICULUM, GRADES 1-12 ^③

(X=direct link; -- = indirect but supportive link)

LEARNING GOAL, BY GRADE*	RELATIONSHIP TO GCED	Global approach to citizenship (IBE-UNESCO, 2016a)	Traditional approach to civics and /or moral education	Grades/ Topics
Become empathetic toward target culture		X (#16)	X	Grade 2, Performance Task: Use realia to compare Lebanese and target culture. Give examples of proverbs in target culture
Develop empathy toward target culture		X (#16)	X	Grade 5, Performance Task: Compare traditions and festivities of native and target culture
Work with authentic materials to become familiar with target culture Understand cultural significant expressions		X (#16)	X	Grade 8, Performance Task: Recognize different parts of a foreign newspaper or magazine Collect comic strips, cartoons, articles which reflect aspects of target culture

^③ Non-comprehensive list of topics and related themes. Those presented are linked directly or indirectly with GCED, as defined by the indicators presented in the Methodology section of this report.

Demonstrate understanding of cultural attitudes	X (#16)	X	Grade 10,11, 12, Performance Task: Compare and contrast customs, actions, and values recurrent in written and oral material with these in the native language
Analyze cultural basis for judgment and evaluation of text	X (#16)	X	Grade 10,11, 12, Performance Task: Compare the systems of values in the native and target language
Draw universal themes from specific cultural items	X (#16)		Grade 10,11, 12, Per- formance Task: List themes of specific cultural nature

The analysis of the presence of the GCED domains in the Lebanese *English Language and Literature* curriculum for grades 1-12 reveals a consistent focus on the GCED domain # 16 throughout all the grade levels. Domain # 16 covers intercultural empathy and is clearly aligned with the curricular main goal of developing intercultural empathy and understanding. However, the remaining GCED domains are not directly linked to the curriculum although the curriculum themes could be indirectly related specifically in the thematic units on Community Helpers, World Events and Issues, Current Issues, Democracy, Human Rights, Human Values, Ecological Environment, Political Systems, and Women Issues.

5.4 Findings for Math Curriculum by school level

Source: *Math Curriculum Decree # 23/M/1997*

Background: The Lebanese curricula include a subject called *Math Curriculum* for grades 1-12 (The years of Basic Education: 1-9 and Secondary Education: 10-12). The Introduction to the curriculum presents the content details and general objectives, activities and materials, teaching methods, and evaluation techniques and procedures to be followed in curriculum implementation.

Analysis: Our analysis of the *Math* curriculum did not show direct links with the GCED domains at the level of topics and grade levels. However, the curriculum includes a few goal orientations that could be indirectly linked to GCED domains as shown in Table 6 below:

TABLE 6.

GCED AND LEBANESE LEARNING GOALS FOR MATH CURRICULUM

(X=direct link; -- = indirect but supportive link)

LEARNING GOAL, BY GRADE*	RELATIONSHIP TO GCED	Global approach to citizenship (IBE-UNESCO, 2016a)	Traditional approach to civics and /or moral education	Grades/ Topics
Aim to form a citizen capable of critical thinking and intellectual autonomy		-- (#2)	X	General Introduction
Use various strategies to tackle difficulties in solving a problem		-- (#2)	X	General Introduction
Recognize tendencies or relations in sequences of simple facts		-- (#2)	X	General Introduction
Use pictorial or symbolic representations		-- (#2)	X	General Introduction

Table 6 above shows critical thinking as a link to GCED as stated in the mathematics curriculum as well as the use of problem-solving strategies and focus on communication among peers or between learners and their respective global peers. However, the math curriculum does not seem to be linked directly to any of the GCED domains.

5.5 Findings for Science Curriculum by school level

Source: *Science Curriculum Decree # 24/M/1997*

Background: The Lebanese curricula include a subject called *Science Curriculum* for grades 1-12 (The years of Basic Education: 1-9 and Secondary Education: 10-12). The Introduction to the curriculum presents the content details and general objectives, activities and materials, teaching methods, and evaluation techniques and procedures to be followed in curriculum implementation.

Analysis: Our analysis of the *Science* curriculum did not show direct links with the GCED domains at the level of topics and grade levels. However, the introduction to the curriculum included a few goal orientations that could be indirectly linked to GCED domains as shown in Table 7 below:

TABLE 7.

GCED AND LEBANESE LEARNING GOALS FOR SCIENCE CURRICULUM

(X=direct link; -- = indirect but supportive link)

LEARNING GOAL, BY GRADE*	RELATIONSHIP TO GCED	Global approach to citizenship (IBE-UNESCO, 2016a)	Traditional approach to civics and /or moral education	Grades/ Topics
Develop the learners' intellectual and practical scientific skills		-- (#2)	X	General Introduction
Deepen the learners' awareness in the ability of humans to understand, invent, and create.		-- (#2)	X	General Introduction
Encourage learners to use scientific knowledge and skills in novel situations especially in everyday life.		-- (#2)	X	General Introduction
Emphasize the role of scientists in the advancement of humankind.		-- (#4; #5)	X	General Introduction
Encourage learners to open to the ideas of scientists from different cultures and to their contributions in the advancement of science.		-- (#7)	X	General Introduction
Encourage learners to work independently and cooperatively in solving scientific problems		-- (#5)	X	General Introduction
Make learners aware of career possibilities in different science related areas		-- (#7)	X	General Introduction

5.6 Findings for Arabic Language and Literature Curriculum by school level

Source: *Arabic Language and Literature Curriculum Decree # 31/M/1998*

Background: The Lebanese curricula include a subject called *Arabic Language and Literature* for grades 1-12 (The years of Basic Education: 1-9 and Secondary Education: 10-12). The Introduction to the *Arabic Language and Literature* curriculum presents the content details and general objectives, activities and materials, teaching methods, and evaluation techniques and procedures to be followed in curriculum implementation.

Analysis: Our analysis of the *Arabic Language and Literature* curriculum did not show alignment with the GCED domains. This is primarily due to the skill-based approach followed designing the Basic Education curriculum with gradual integration of genres and focus on types and literary figures and their major works at the secondary level. Yet, one could locate some suggested curricular content and learning goals that could be indirectly linked to the certain GCED domains. For example, in Grade 8 the topic of “National and Human Values” and its corresponding learning goals explicated into knowledge, abilities, skills-dispositions pertaining to realizing the importance of national identity, great men and women from Lebanon and the world, and moral/ethical values could be indirectly related to the GCED domain and Affirmation/Characterization domain. Likewise, suggested texts under the theme of “Cultural Interaction among Peoples” at the secondary level can be exploited to address a number of GCED domains and objectives.

5.7 Findings for ICT reform in 2012

Source: The Ministry of Education and Higher Education Strategic Planning Development Team February 29, 2012

The Lebanese MEHE and CERD initiated an ICT reform policy (2012) which aimed at using technology in all of Lebanon schools. Table 8 below reports the analysis results regarding the presence of GCED topics as reflected in the ICT policy reform document.

TABLE 8.

GCED AND LEBANESE LEARNING GOALS FOR ICT Reform Policy (2012)

(X=direct link; -- = indirect but supportive link)

LEARNING GOAL, BY GRADE*	RELATIONSHIP TO GCED	Global approach to citizenship (IBE-UNESCO, 2016a)	Traditional approach to civics and /or moral education	Grades/ Topics
Collaboration with local and global peers		X (# 6)	X	
High-quality learning to all Lebanese students		X (#1)	X	
The Declaration of Human Rights; the International Convention of Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights; and the International Agreement on the Rights of the Child		X (19)	X	
Reference to equity, collaborative work; communication and self-expression; complex problem solving		X (#2)	X	

The analysis in Table 8 above shows reference to the utilities of ICT in facilitating “collaboration with local and global peers”(MEHE, 2012, p. 8). Furthermore, the ICT integration is needed in order to ensure “21st century learning environment”(MEHE, 2012,p. 12). In addition, the ICT reform policy facilitates “high-quality learning to all Lebanese students” (MEHE, 2012, p.13). Moreover, the principles of ICT reform policy encompasses reference to the “*The Declaration of Human Rights; the International Convention of Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights; and the International Agreement on the Rights of the Child* (MEHE, 2010: 12)(p.18). More indicators related to “...Inquiry;... solve problems and create new paradigms and understandings; and to share, communicate and collaborate with colleagues across the globe as they do so”(MEHE, 2012,p.21) are emphasized. Reference to equity, collaborative work; communication and self-expression; complex problem solving; choices about approaches to and demonstration of learning; access to multiple Sources (MEHE, 2012, p. 24) are also highlighted. Reference to Sustainability which “... deals with *knowledge-formation* (building the skills and knowledge of all stakeholders regarding the ways in which technology can add value to teaching and learning) (MEHE, 2012, p. 24) is emphasized.

5.8 Evidence of GCED integration from MEHE and CERD initiatives

The Lebanese MEHE and CERD are cognizant of the importance of and the need for integrating GCED. There are attempts at integrating GCED education into the Lebanese educational system. For instance, in 2011, MEHE and CERD attempted to revise the curricula and textbooks in light of accumulated lessons and Information Communication Technology (ICT) integration and based on modern international educational trends for effective teaching and learning and sustainable development and further activities and studies were conducted in subsequent years and are presently underway. CERD declared that “The future learner belongs to the information age and digital interaction platforms, so the learner’s profile fits the era of communication, openness and globalization. Our thinking stems from shaping the global profile of the learner who possesses the twenty-first century skills while preserving tradition and national values, paving the way for analysis, experimentation, and lifelong learning” (CERD, 2017). Furthermore, CERD has highlighted the significance of “The Didactic Triangle” which should be reflected through the learner’s individual interaction through the process of knowledge acquisition and interaction with peers and society, both inside and outside the classroom. It will contribute to the learner’s acquisition of the expected competencies enabling him/her to invest these competencies in the various domains of academic and real-life situations” (CERD, 2017).

5.9 Findings from pertinent studies investigating teaching human rights in Lebanese Civics textbooks

A number of studies have investigated the teaching of human rights in Lebanon's official civics textbooks. Evidence from these studies suggests the pedagogy of teaching human rights was not clear in the Lebanese civics textbooks although the developers of the 1997 curriculum stated explicitly that they had adopted a didactic approach to teaching these rights as it was strongly manifested in the analysis of the directions, content, and assessments associated with human rights. The value awareness model characterized the assessment activities to a certain extent, yet students were denied opportunities to critically engage in the assessment activities that were restricted to asking students to identify some rights in the community without shedding light on the challenges and difficulties they might face.

Moreover, the official exams taken by all Lebanese ninth and twelfth graders were limited to remembering information around elections and freedom of expression without providing rubrics or assessment criteria for the answers (Shuayb, 2015). The experiential and activity-centered learning involving the activation of learners' prior knowledge, giving activities that utilize the learners' experiences and knowledge, and using problem-solving and inquiry-based approaches should be utilized to promote cooperative efforts in explaining ideas, analyzing themes and performing activities (Tibbitts & Kirchsclaeger, 2010).

6. Conclusion

Our analysis revealed the following:

- There is a direct link between the *Civics and National Education Curriculum* with GCED particularly in GCED domains of humanitarian law, human rights, peace building as well as discrimination, racism, and intercultural empathy and respect. Furthermore, global citizenship values and attitudes as well as those indicators related to systems of governance (institutional structures, processes, peace building, and transnational cooperation). However, a number of domains, particularly those pertaining to engagement, participation, and civic protest issues as well as debates on socio-political issues, direct actions on issues of global reach and systems are not addressed. In addition, The *Civics and National Education Curriculum* does not address the behavioural domains of the GCED categories, particularly engagement, participation, protest on global issues, information and debates on socio-political issues, and direct actions on issues of global reach.
- The *Lebanese English Language and Literature Curriculum* consistently addressed the GCED domain of Intercultural Empathy through grades 1-12. However, it does not directly address other GCED domains. Yet, it should be noted that the theme-based approach followed in the curriculum design and the suggested many suggested themes (Community Helpers, World Events and Issues, Current Issues, Democracy, Human Rights, Human Values, Ecological Environment, Political Systems, and Women Issues) could be exploited to address and quite a range of GCED domains and objectives.
- The *Arabic Language and Literature* curriculum does not seem to be aligned with the GCED domains given its focus on language sub-skills, genres, literary figures, and corresponding works. Yet, certain assigned texts, particularly those under the theme of “Cultural Interaction among Peoples” at the secondary level lend themselves to addressing certain GCED domains and objectives.
- The Math and Science curricula do not show direct links with GCED domains, although general introductions to these curricula include orientations that may have indirect links with certain GCED domains, particularly those pertaining global citizen values and transnational cooperation and exchange of ideas.
- The Lebanese MEHE and the CERD are aware of the importance of integrating GCED and are making efforts to integrate its various domains into the Lebanese educational system.

7. Recommendations

1. Build on the GCED integration efforts already underway in *Civics and National Education Curriculum* learning goals and practices and expand it to the behavioural domains of socio-affective and behavioral domain categories which call for engagement and participation in direct actions on issues of global reach.
2. Utilize the themes of the English Language and Curriculum (Community Helpers, World Events and Issues, Current Issues, Democracy, Human Rights, Human Values, Ecological Environment, Political Systems, and Women Issues) to strengthen integration of GCED into the Lebanese educational system.
3. Explore the potential of more deliberate integration of GCED into various school subjects, particularly math and science.
4. Integrate GCED themes and topics into revised editions of textbooks

8. Final Thoughts

GCED is in line with modern educational trends and scientific developments. It is also in consonance with the international competency frameworks and the results of previous studies carried out under the supervision of the Lebanese MEHE and examined the competencies required to meet the challenges and priorities of the 21st century in order to reach excellence in education. GCED requires communicating with the various educational groups, cooperating with all parties concerned with the learners in order to develop GCED domains as well as with civil society institutions in order to link the education with the Lebanese and international societies and contribute to its development and growth as well as develop the learner's emotional intelligence to improve and grow his/her global citizenship network.

The ethics of GCED include commitment to the principles of the education ethics, respect for, and implementation of, laws relating to the educational system in Lebanon and in the global educational institution in which the teachers work, learners communicate and interact in an atmosphere characterized by diversity, tolerance and respect for others. Continuous GCED development also implies the involvement of the MEHE, UNESCO, and CERD in order to ensure the dynamic

development and construction of learners' global citizenship identity. Likewise, specialized GCED professional practices should include planning for the supervision of teaching-learning processes, the application and development of a variety of supervision methods, evaluating the effectiveness of the learning process in relation to the teacher's performance/curriculum/teaching methods, as well as making suggestions and valuable contributions to the development of educational programs (curriculum, teaching methods and techniques, assessment methods and remedial techniques).

It should be noted that GCED involves communicating with various educational partners and learners, encouraging the teacher to build positive relationships with the school community and the environment (colleagues - administration and learners ...), and improving the school environment through the development of the prevailing relations. In addition, it should be emphasized that GCED contributes to social change through reflection on performance and contribution to the improvement of the teachers' performance. Expressing commitment to GCED ethics in dealing with all parties provides a positive image of the education profession and abiding by laws and regulations and their application. The life of an individual and the various aspects of their personality should be strongly and directly affected by GCED factors, whether in school or outside, as they can have an impact on society in terms of psychological, emotional and social compatibility.

Finally, the process of teaching and learning in GCED needs to be consistent with the principles and values of transformative education – for example, democratic, participatory, creative and inquiry-based learning—to facilitate the development of socio-emotional and behavioral capacities for action”(p.13) “In the formal curriculum, GCED can be delivered within existing subjects (such as civics or citizenship education, mathematics, social and environmental studies or health education), integrated into selected subjects, or delivered as a whole school approach...The principles of GCED also require them to examine their own practices, perceptions, values and world and to see educators themselves as learners and as global citizens”(p.32).

GCED entails goals, notions, definitions, pedagogies, theoretical models and pedagogical approaches. The implementation of HRE embraces policies, practices, curriculum initiatives, teacher training, professional development programs and environments for promoting HRE (Tibbitts & Kirchsclaeger, 2010). Measuring the outcomes of any HRE program includes gauging the outcomes accomplished by students, educators, and institutions (Tibbitts & Kirchsclaeger, 2010). There should be a correlation among the transformative, whole-school approach and accountability model in order to ensure

effectiveness of an HRE-and GCED based curriculum that could address the Syrian influx for the following reasons: Transformative learning takes place when individuals change their perspectives by critically analyzing their claims and views and determinedly applying strategies that generate new methods of perceiving their worlds (Awada, Diab & Faour, 2018; Mezirow, 1997).

The GCED indicators can be used to clarify the expected gains by the end of each academic school year. The aim of the GCED framework should not stop at the limits of the basic preparation, or at determining the level of performance, it should go beyond that to help the teachers, stakeholders and learners to keep up with the challenges of our time and with the rapid technological progress. **The GCED-based evaluation** should be a process that aims at showing the value of what is being evaluated by collecting data about it and examining the degree of alignment between the present situation and the desired situation. GCED-based evaluation should be a key factor and a key entry to improve the educational process, as it helps stakeholders to gather information in order to assess the performance of the learners in all grade levels. Educational meetings should be held between the GCED educational trainers and the teachers within the frame of the subject matter in order to lead to recommendations, follow-up mechanisms and subsequent field visit.

TABLE 9.

APPEARANCE OF GCED INDICATORS (IBE-UNESCO, 2016) IN LEBANESE POLICY DOCUMENTS

(X=present with explicit links to the global level; -- = present with no explicit links to the global level, traditional civics approach;

*= may be seen as related to the wider set of GCED and SED indicators, although not presented as supporting global citizenship per se.)

Document Indicator	Curriculum reform policy 1995	ICT education reform(2012)	Curriculum for Mathematics	Curriculum for Science	Curriculum for Civics and National Education	Curriculum for English Language and Literature ^④	Curriculum for Arabic Language and Literature ^⑤
I. Justification and general orientations about GCED.							
Justification of GCED (socio-economic, political, cultural, moral).	--	X		--	X		
Global Citizenship (affirmation; characterisation).	--	X	--		X		--
II. Cognitive domain categories.							
<i>Global systems, structures and processes:</i>	--			--	X		
Global governance system, structures (institutions), and processes.				--	X		
Humanitarian law, human rights, peace building, rule of international laws.	--	X			X		
Trans-national corporations.	--				X		
Other (global systems).							
<i>Global issues:</i>							
Globalisation (socio-economic, political, cultural).					--		
North-south relationships, developed-developing interconnections, interdependence.							
Climate change, biodiversity, sustainable development.							
Global poverty, global inequality.					--		

^④ GCED domains and goals may be linked though assigned themes.^⑤ GCED domains and goals may be linked at the secondary level through assigned texts related to "Cultural Interaction among Peoples".

Genocide, terrorism, war, refugees.							
Diseases (Ebola, HIV & AIDS).							
Other (global issues).							
III. Attitudinal (socio-affective) domain categories.							
<i>Multiple identities:</i>							
Humanity as privileged referent of identity.					--		
Nation as privileged referent of identity.							
'Embedded identities': local, national, regional (supra-national), and global.							
<i>Difference and respect for diversity: multicultural and/or international contexts-levels:</i>							
Intercultural empathy, dialogue, respect, solidarity (referred to intercultural or international, regional, or world-wide contexts).					X	X	
Discrimination, racism (referred to intercultural or international, regional, or world-wide contexts).					X		
Values and attitudes for Global Citizenship.		X			--		
IV. Behavioural domain categories.							
<i>Engagement, participation, actions:</i>							
Current and future participation in civic protest on global issues.							
Information and debates on socio-political issues of global reach.							
Direct action on issues of global reach.							

References

- APCEIU. Global Citizenship: A guide for policy makers. 2017.
https://www.bridge47.org/sites/default/files/2018-12/global_citizenship_education_guide_for_policy_makers.pdf
- Awada, G., Diab, H., & Faour, K. (2017). A call for curriculum reform to combat refugees' crisis: The case of Lebanon. *Curriculum Journal*, 1-17.
- IBE-UNESCO. 2017. Global Citizenship Concepts in Curriculum Guidelines of 10 Countries: A Comparative Analysis. *In-Progress Reflection Series No. 9*. Geneva, IBE-UNESCO.
- Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE). 2012. ICT Plan report.
Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) report. 2013. Citizenship Committee.
- Tibbitts, F. 2015. *Curriculum Development and Review for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education*. Published jointly by UNESCO, Council of Europe, OSCE/ODIHR and the Organization of American States. Paris, UNESCO.
- United Nations (UN). 2016. United Nations Committee for Development Policy. List of Least Developed Countries (as of May 2016). Retrieved from:
http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/policy/cdp/ldc/ldc_list.pdf
- UNESCO. 1974. *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms*. (Records of the General Conference, Eighteenth Session Paris, 17 October to 23 November 1974, Volume 1).
- . 2015a. *Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives*. Paris, UNESCO.
- . 2015b. *Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2015. Education for All 2000-2015: Achievements and Challenges*. Paris, UNESCO

ANNEX A

UNESCO GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION TOPICS AND LEARNING OBJECTIVES

BOX 1.

GCED Key Learning Outcomes

Cognitive:

- Learners acquire knowledge and understanding of local, national and global issues and the interconnectedness and interdependency of different countries and populations
- Learners develop skills for critical thinking and analysis

Socio-emotional:

- Learners experience a sense of belonging to a common humanity, sharing values and responsibilities, based on human rights
- Learners develop attitudes of empathy, solidarity and respect for differences and diversity

Behavioural:

- Learners act effectively and responsibly at local, national and global levels for a more peaceful and sustainable world
- Learners develop motivation and willingness to take necessary actions

Source: UNESCO (2015a). *Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives*. Paris: UNESCO, p. 29. ⁶


⁶ For a more detailed and age-specific rendering of UNESCO'S GCED learning outcomes and topics, see pages 31-40.

ANNEX B

UNESCO GCED-WG CORE COMPETENCIES FOR GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

- Empathy
- Critical thinking/problem solving
- Ability to communicate and collaborate with others
- Conflict resolution
- Sense of security and identity
- Shared universal values
- Respect for diversity/intercultural understanding
- Recognition of global issues (e.g., environmental, social, economic, etc.)

Source: Global Citizenship Education Working Group (GCED-WG). 2016. *Measuring Global Citizenship Education Toolkit*. June. Unpublished internal working document, p. 8.



GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP CONCEPTS IN THE CURRICULUM OF LEBANON: ANALYSIS AND INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

APCEIU

Asia-Pacific Centre of
Education for International Understanding
under the auspices of UNESCO